



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 16, 2013

Mr. Gary A. Scott
Assistant City Attorney
City of Conroe
P.O. Box 3066
Conroe, Texas 77305

OR2013-18008

Dear Mr. Scott:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 502607.

The City of Conroe (the "city") received a request for case number 13073117. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). The submitted information pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse; thus, this information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of section 22.011 as “a person younger than 17 years of age”). In this instance, however, the submitted report reveals the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the report and is not the individual alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Thus, the city may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold the information at issue from this requestor. *Id.* However, section 261.201(l)(2) states that any information that

is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). You state the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). In this instance, the suspect was eight years old at the time of the offense. Because the legislature has chosen to protect only the law enforcement records of a child who is between the ages of ten and sixteen at the time of the reported conduct, we find the submitted information is not confidential under section 58.007(c). *See* Open Records Decision No. 487 at 2 (1987) (language of confidentiality statute controls scope of protection). Thus as you have not established the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code, the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the submitted information relates to a concluded case

that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. However, the basic information does not include motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code or the social security number of an individual other than the arrestee. *See id.* Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

You claim the basic information is subject to the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found, v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. We find the city would normally have to withhold some of the basic information under common-law privacy. However, as a parent of the minor with the privacy interest, the requestor has a special right of access to information that would ordinarily be withheld to protect the minor's common-law privacy, and such information cannot be withheld from her on that basis. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

¹Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, if the city receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ni A. Ybarra". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Ni" and the last name "Ybarra" clearly visible.

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/ac

Ref: ID# 502607

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)