



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 18, 2013

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2013-18183

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 502812 (City of Fort Worth PIR No. W027662).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for reports involving complaints made by the requestor against a named individual during a specified period of time. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly

¹Although you do not raise sections 552.130 and 552.147 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise these exceptions based on your markings.

objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You state the present request requires the city to compile the criminal history of the named individual and implicates the individual's right to privacy. However, after reviewing the request and the submitted information, we find the requestor is seeking specific reports involving herself and the named individual. Accordingly, the request does not implicate the named individual's right to privacy, and the city may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 on the basis of the named individual's privacy interests as a compilation of his criminal history.

Next, we note some of the submitted information may have been the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2013-14511 (2013). In that ruling, we determined with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold report numbers 13-44490 and 13-59188 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. We have no indication there has been any change in the law, facts, or circumstances on which the previous ruling was based. Accordingly, we conclude the city may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2013-14511 as a previous determination and withhold or release report numbers 13-44490 and 13-59188 in accordance with that ruling.² *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure).

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

You claim some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.³

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147. Accordingly, the city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may rely on Open Records Letter No. 2013-14511 as a previous determination and withhold or release report numbers 13-44490 and 13-59188 in accordance with that ruling. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city may also withhold the marked social security number under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.⁴

You also ask this office to issue a previous determination permitting the city to withhold information responsive to requests concerning a compilation of a person's criminal history information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, without requesting a ruling from this office. We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

³We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

⁴We note the information being released in this instance includes information that may be confidential with respect to the general public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Therefore, if the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "N. A. Ybarra".

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/ac

Ref: ID# 502812

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)