



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 29, 2013

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2013-18825

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 503865 (Fort Worth PIR # W027929).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for all reports at two specified addresses involving two named individuals and the requestor from 2008 to the date of the request. You state the city has redacted motor vehicle record information other than the requestor's as permitted by section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You further state you have released some of the requested information. You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."

¹Section 552.130(c) authorizes a governmental body to redact, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the motor vehicle record information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3). See Gov't Code § 552.130(c); see also *id.* § 552.130(d)-(e) (requestor may appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information under section 552.130(c) to attorney general, and a governmental body withholding information pursuant to section 552.130(c) must provide certain notice to requestor).

Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The present request seeks information pertaining to two named individuals other than the requestor. This request requires the city to compile the named individuals' criminal history and implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You have submitted information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your claim under section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation and our review of the information, we conclude release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court describes law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable to the information at issue.

As you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). With the exception of basic information, which you state you have released, the city may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lauren E. Kleine
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEK/bhf

Ref: ID# 503865

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)