



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 20, 2013

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2013-22311

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 509157 (Dallas OR Nos. 2013-11622, 2013-11623, 2013-11624, 2013-11627, and 2013-11628).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received requests from multiple requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident, including photographs and video recordings. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ We have also received and considered comments from one of the requestors. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note you have marked some of the submitted information as not responsive to the requests. We agree the information you marked is not responsive to the instant requests because it was created after the date the requests were received. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the city is not required to release non-responsive information in response to these requests.

Next, we address one of the requestors' contention that the city did not comply with the procedural requirements of the Act. The requestor asserts he was not timely notified of the city's request for a ruling from this office as required by section 552.301(d) of the

¹We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(d), a governmental body must provide the requestor with (1) a written statement that the governmental body wishes to withhold the requested information and has asked for a decision from the attorney general, and (2) a copy of the governmental body's written communication to the attorney general within ten business days of receiving the request for information. *Id.* § 552.301(d). Pursuant to section 552.302, a governmental body's failure to timely provide the requestor with a copy of its written communication to this office results in the presumption that the information is public. The city states it received the requests for information on September 27, 2013. We note this office does not count the date the request was received for the purpose of calculating a governmental body's deadlines under the Act. Therefore, the ten-business-day deadline to provide information to the requestors pursuant to section 552.301(d) was October 11, 2013. The requestor submitted a copy of the envelope in which you inform him of your request for a decision from this office. The envelope in which you submitted notice to the requestor under section 552.301(d) bears a post meter mark of October 14, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308(a) (prescribing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the city failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body overcomes this presumption by demonstrating a compelling reason to withhold the information. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason generally exists when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3, 325 at 2 (1982).

Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, in failing to comply with section 552.301, the city has waived its argument under section 552.108. However, the interests of a governmental body, other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301, to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 586 (1991), 469 (1987). You inform us the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue. Therefore, we will consider whether the city may withhold the submitted responsive information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted responsive information pertains to pending criminal cases. You further state the district attorney’s office objects to the disclosure of the information at issue. Based on your representations, we conclude the release of the submitted responsive information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted responsive information.

However, we note, and you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, you may withhold the submitted responsive information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 509157

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 5 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)