



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 4, 2014

Ms. Savannah Gonzalez
Assistant District Attorney
Hidalgo County
100 North Clossner, Room 303
Edinburgh, Texas 78539

OR2014-02158

Dear Ms. Gonzalez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 513133 (Hidalgo Reference No. 2013-0054-DA).

The Hidalgo County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received two requests for information pertaining to a specified case involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Although you contend the submitted information is protected by common-law privacy as a compilation of criminal records, we note the requestor seeks specified records. Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the present request requires the district attorney's office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. Accordingly, none of the submitted information may be withheld as a compilation of the individual's criminal history under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Section 58.007 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). You state the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007. However, you have failed to demonstrate the submitted information depicts an individual who is ten years of age or older and under the age of seventeen as a suspect or offender of delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Id. § 261.201(a), (h). You contend the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a). In this instance, however, the information at issue is related to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect that occurred in a child care facility that was regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code at the time of the incident in question. Section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42. *Id.* § 261.201(h). Therefore, section 261.201(a) of the Family Code is not applicable to the submitted information, and the district attorney's office may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the information relates to an investigation that was referred to the district attorney's office and taken to a grand-jury. You further explain a no-bill was

returned by the grand jury. Based on this representation and our review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note basic information includes, among other things, an arrestee's name and social security number and a detailed description of the offense. See Open Records Decision No. 127. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2).

We understand you assert the basic information maybe subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As noted above, common-law privacy protects highly intimate or embarrassing information that is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of a juvenile victim of abuse or neglect. See Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. Although the district attorney's office would ordinarily be required to withhold some of the basic information pertaining to the child victim, the requestor is an attorney for the child victim listed in the submitted report. As such, the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to information the district attorney's office would be required to withhold from the public to protect the minor child's privacy. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond the right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the basic information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

¹We note the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lana L. Freeman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LLF/bhf

Ref: ID# 513133

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)