



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 6, 2014

Mr. Jacob Wedemeyer
Assistant County Attorney
County of El Paso
500 East San Antonio, Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2014-02343

Dear Mr. Wedemeyer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 513258 (CA-OP-13-544).

The El Paso County Medical Examiner's Office (the "medical examiner's office") received a request for all available documents pertaining to a specified shooting. You state you are releasing some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.1085 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides as follows:

The medical examiner shall keep full and complete records properly indexed, giving the name if known of every person whose death is investigated, the place where the body was found, the date, the cause and manner of death, and shall issue a death certificate. . . . The records are subject to required public disclosure in accordance with [the Act], except that a photograph or x-ray of a body taken during an autopsy is excepted from required public disclosure in accordance with [the Act], but is subject to disclosure:

- (1) under a subpoena or authority of other law; or
- (2) if the photograph or x-ray is of the body of a person who died while in the custody of law enforcement.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.25, § 11. You state a portion of the submitted photographs are confidential pursuant to section 11 of article 49.25. Upon review, we agree some of the photographs at issue consist of photographs of a body taken during an autopsy. You state neither of the statutory exceptions to confidentiality is applicable in this instance. Accordingly, we find the medical examiner's office must withhold the autopsy photographs at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.¹

Section 552.1085 of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part, the following:

(c) A sensitive crime scene image in the custody of a governmental body is confidential and excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 and a governmental body may not permit a person to view or copy the image except as provided by this section. This section applies to any sensitive crime scene image regardless of the date that the image was taken or recorded.

Gov't Code § 552.1085(c). For purposes of section 552.1085, "sensitive crime scene image" means "a photograph or video recording taken at a crime scene, contained in or part of a closed criminal case, that depicts a deceased person in a state of dismemberment, decapitation, or similar mutilation or that depicts the deceased person's genitalia." *See id.* § 552.1085(a)(6). Some of the submitted information consists of photographs that were taken at a crime scene as part of a criminal case that we understand is now closed. Upon review, we find some of these photographs, which we have indicated, consist of sensitive crime scene images which must be withheld under section 552.1085 of the Government Code.² However, we find the remaining information does not consist of sensitive crime scene images for purposes of section 552.1085 of the Government Code, and none of it may be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy,

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. We note because the common-law right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, common-law privacy does not protect information that relates only to a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984), H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). We note the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and therefore may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; ORD 272 at 1. However, the United States Supreme Court has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. *See Nat'l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 541 U.S. 157 (2004). You state you have attempted to notify the deceased individual's family of the request for information and of their right to assert a privacy interest in the information at issue. However, as of the date of this decision, we have not received any correspondence from the deceased individual's family requesting the information at issue be withheld. Thus, we have no basis for determining the family's privacy interest in the information at issue. Therefore, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

In summary, the medical examiner's office must withhold the submitted autopsy photographs under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The medical examiner's office must withhold the photographs we have indicated under section 552.1085 of the Government Code. The medical examiner's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Thana Hussaini
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TH/som

Ref: ID# 513258

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)