



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 20, 2014

Mr. Michael B. Gary
Chief Legal Officer
Harris County Appraisal District
P.O. Box 920975
Houston, Texas 77292-0975

OR2014-03116

Dear Mr. Gary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 514703 (HCAD# 13-3094).

The Harris County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for information pertaining to a specified property. You state you will release some information to the requestor. You further state you do not have information pertaining to a portion of the requested information.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state the release of some of the submitted information may implicate the interests of Pictometry International Corporation ("Pictometry"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation demonstrating, the district notified Pictometry of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments stating why its information should not be released. See Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on

¹The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. See *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

We first note, and you acknowledge, the district did not comply with its ten-business-day deadline under section 552.301(b) of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). In addition, we note the district did not comply with its fifteen-business-day deadline under section 552.301(e). *See id.* § 552.301(e). A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). This statutory presumption can generally be overcome when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Because third-party interests and sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will consider whether the submitted information may be withheld on behalf of Pictometry and address the district's arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.149.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Pictometry explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Pictometry has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Pictometry may have in the information.

²We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which provides the following:

(a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

(b) Information made confidential by this section may be disclosed:

...

(2) to the person who filed the statement or report or the owner of property subject to the statement, report, or information or to a representative of either authorized in writing to receive the information[.]

Tax Code § 22.27(a), (b)(2). We understand the district is an “appraisal office” for purposes of section 22.27(a). You state Exhibit E was provided by the property owner and consists of evidence submitted by the property owner for an Appraisal Review Board hearing. Thus, we understand you to contend the information at issue consists of “other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property.” You state the exceptions in section 22.27(b) do not apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find the district must withhold the information in Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code.

Section 552.149 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity

by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of [the Act].

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the property owner or the owner's agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser of the applicable appraisal district a copy of each item of information described by Section 41.461(a)(2), Tax Code, and a copy of each item of information that the chief appraiser took into consideration but does not plan to introduce at the hearing on the protest. In addition, the property owner or agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser comparable sales data from a reasonable number of sales that is relevant to any matter to be determined by the appraisal review board at the hearing on the property owner's protest[.]

Gov't Code § 552.149(a)-(b). The Eighty-second Texas Legislature amended section 552.149 to limit the applicability of subsections 552.149(a) and (b) to those counties having a population of 50,000 or more. *Id.* § 552.149(e). We note Harris County has a population of 50,000 or more. The legislative history of the statutory predecessor to section 552.149 indicates it was enacted as a result of the issuance of several open records rulings of this office in which we ruled information provided by the multiple listing service (the "MLS") to appraisal districts under confidentiality agreements is subject to required public disclosure under the Act. House Comm. on State Affairs, Bill Analysis, Tex. Comm. Substitute H.B. 2188, 80th Leg., R.S. (2007). Because of these rulings, many MLS agencies stopped providing sales information to appraisal districts. The bill analysis of House Bill 2188 states the purpose of this statute is to allow the relationships between the MLS and appraisal districts to continue. *Id.* In this instance, you state the information you have submitted as Exhibit D relates to real property sales and was provided to the district by a private entity. You state the requestor is not the owner of the property at issue or the agent of the owner. *See* Gov't Code § 552.149(b). Based on your representations and our review, we find the district must withhold the information in Exhibit D under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information in Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code and the information in Exhibit D under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 514703

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Linda K. Salpini
Pictometry International Corporation
100 Town Centre Drive, Suite A
Rochester, New York 14623
(w/o enclosures)