



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 11, 2014

Ms. Hadassah Schloss
Open Records Coordinator
Texas General Land Office
P.O. Box 12873
Austin, Texas 78711-2873

OR2014-04133

Dear Ms. Schloss:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 516603.

The Texas General Land Office (the "GLO") received a request for the names of the public retail entities that purchase electricity through the GLO's State Power Program.¹ Although you do not take any position as to whether the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under the Act, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released.² See Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining

¹We note the GLO sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date therequest is clarified or narrowed).

²Although you initially raise section 552.104 of the Government Code, you have not provided any arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we do not address section 552.104. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(A), .302.

statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have received comments from Cavallo Energy Texas, LLC (“Cavallo”).

Initially, we note the information we have marked is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not consist of the names of the public retail entities that purchase electricity through the GLO’s State Power Program. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the GLO is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Next, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body’s notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Public Power Pool, Reliant Energy Solutions, or Energy for Schools explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Public Power Pool, Reliant Energy Solutions, or Energy for Schools have protected proprietary interests in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the GLO may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Public Power Pool, Reliant Energy Solutions, or Energy for Schools may have in the information.

Section 552.110(a) protects trade secrets obtained from a person and privileged or confidential by statute or judicial decision. Gov’t Code § 552.110(a). The Texas Supreme Court has adopted the definition of trade secret from section 757 of the Restatement of Torts, which holds a trade secret to be:

any formula, pattern, device or compilation of information which is used in one’s business, and which gives him an opportunity to obtain an advantage over competitors who do not know or use it. It may be a formula for a chemical compound, a process of manufacturing, treating or preserving materials, a pattern for a machine or other device, or a list of customers. It differs from other secret information in a business . . . in that it is not simply information as to single or ephemeral events in the conduct of the business A trade secret is a process or device for continuous use in the operation of the business. . . . [It may] relate to the sale of goods or to other operations in the business, such as a code for determining discounts, rebates

or other concessions in a price list or catalogue, or a list of specialized customers, or a method of bookkeeping or other office management.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939); *see also Hyde Corp. v. Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d 776 (Tex. 1958). In determining whether particular information constitutes a trade secret, this office considers the Restatement's definition of trade secret as well as the Restatement's list of six trade secret factors.³ RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b. This office must accept a claim information subject to the Act is excepted as a trade secret if a *prima facie* case for the exception is made and no argument is submitted that rebuts the claim as a matter of law. *See* Open Records Decision No. 552 at 5 (1990). However, we cannot conclude section 552.110(a) is applicable unless it has been shown the information meets the definition of a trade secret and the necessary factors have been demonstrated to establish a trade secret claim. Open Records Decision No. 402 (1983).

Cavallo asserts its responsive information constitutes trade secrets under section 552.110(a) of the Government Code. Upon review, we find Cavallo has demonstrated its client information constitutes a trade secret. Thus, the GLO must withhold Cavallo's responsive information under section 552.110(a) of the Government Code. The GLO must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³The Restatement of Torts lists the following six factors as indicia of whether information constitutes a trade secret:

- (1) the extent to which the information is known outside of [the company];
- (2) the extent to which it is known by employees and other involved in [the company's] business;
- (3) the extent of measures taken by [the company] to guard the secrecy of the information;
- (4) the value of the information to [the company] and [its] competitors;
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended by [the company] in developing the information;
- (6) the ease or difficulty with which the information could be properly acquired or duplicated by others.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b; *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 319 at 2 (1982), 306 at 2 (1982), 255 at 2 (1980).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Megan G. Holloway
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MGH/akg

Ref: ID# 516603

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Teresa Kelly
Cavallo Energy Texas LLC
4295 San Felipe, Suite 200
Houston, Texas 77027
(w/o enclosures)

Donald Lee
Public Power Pool
c/o Hadassah Schloss
Open Records Coordinator
Texas General Land Office
P.O. Box 12873
Austin, Texas 78711-2873
(w/o enclosures)

Bill Wheeler
Reliant Energy Solutions
1201 Fannin Street, Suite 5343
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)

Frank Delaro
Energy for Schools
c/o Hadassah Schloss
Open Records Coordinator
Texas General Land Office
P.O. Box 12873
Austin, Texas 78711-2873
(w/o enclosures)