



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 20, 2014

Ms. Catelyn H. Kostbar
Administrative Technician III
Harris County Appraisal District
P.O. Box 920975
Houston, Texas 77292-0975

OR2014-04752

Dear Ms. Kostbar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 517492 (HCAD Internal Ref. No. 13-3451).

The Harris County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for all documents contained in the district's files related to a specified account. You state you will release some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.110 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state the release of some of the submitted information may implicate the interests of Pictometry International Corporation ("Pictometry"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation demonstrating, the district notified Pictometry of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments stating why its information should not be released. *See Gov't Code* § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the district has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by a showing the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Because sections 552.101, 552.110, and 552.130 of the Government Code and third-party interests can provide compelling reasons to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of sections 552.101, 552.110, and 552.130, as well as any arguments submitted by a third party, to the submitted information.²

We note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Pictometry explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Pictometry has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Although you raise section 552.110, we note section 552.110 protects the interests of third parties that provide information to governmental bodies, not the interests of governmental bodies themselves. *See generally* Open Records Decision No. 592 (1991). Thus, we do not address your arguments under section 552.110. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Pictometry may have in the information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which provides in pertinent part:

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

Tax Code § 22.27(a). You indicate the district is an “appraisal office” for purposes of section 22.27(a). You state the information in Exhibits C and D was furnished to the district by a property owner in connection with the appraisal of property. You state none of the exceptions in section 22.27(b) apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review, we find the information in Exhibits C and D is confidential under section 22.27 of the Tax Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.³

In summary, the district must withhold Exhibits C and D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27 of the Tax Code and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov’t Code § 552.130(c)*. If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/ac

Ref: ID# 517492

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Linda K. Salpini
Pictometry International
100 Town Centre Drive, Suite A
Rochester, New York 14623
(w/o enclosures)