



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 27, 2014

Mr. Richard L. Bilbie
Interim City Attorney
City of Harlingen
P.O. Box 2207
Harlingen, Texas 78551

OR2014-05108

Dear Mr. Bilbie:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 519725.

The Harlingen Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 522.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note that the submitted information includes a citation. Because a copy of the citation has been provided to the individual who was cited, we find that release of the citation will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold the citation under section 552.108(a)(1). You state the remaining information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the

detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. The department must release basic information, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976)* (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the citation and basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

You also claim the citation is excepted under section 552.103 of the Government Code, which provides:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd

¹We note that basic information may generally not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

We note the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information related to litigation through the discovery process. *See* Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4-5. If the opposing party has seen or had access to information related to pending or anticipated litigation, through discovery or otherwise, then there is no interest in withholding that information from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). In this instance, you state the citation is related to a pending prosecution. You indicate the recipient of the citation is the defendant in the prosecution. Thus, as the opposing party in the litigation has already seen the citation, we conclude the department may not withhold the citation under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

We note the citation contains information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.

Finally, you claim the basic information is subject to the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code.³ Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information and the citation, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the citation, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/bhf

Ref: ID# 519725

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)