



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 31, 2014

Mr. Daniel Ortiz
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2014-05295

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 518481 (El Paso Ref. No. 14-1026-3973).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual, including a specified arrest. You state the department has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to an ongoing criminal investigation. You further state, and provide documentation showing, the submitted information pertains to a case pending prosecution with the El Paso County District Attorney's Office. We note, however, the submitted information includes a DIC-24 Statutory Warning and a DIC-25 Notice of Suspension. Because copies of these documents were provided to the arrestee, we find you have not demonstrated how release of the DIC-24 form or DIC-25 form, which we have marked, will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. You further have not demonstrated how release of the DIC-24 form or DIC-25 form would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution. Accordingly, the DIC 24 form and DIC-25 form may not be withheld under subsection 552.108(a)(1) or subsection 552.108(b)(1). However, based on your representations and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, we note, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form and basic information, the department may generally withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Next, we address your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Section 552.103 provides:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the

state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

We note the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information related to litigation through the discovery process. See ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, any information obtained from or provided to all other parties in the anticipated or pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. The submitted DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form were provided to the arrestee; thus, the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Furthermore, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Next, we must address whether the requestor has a right of access to the information subject to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In this instance, the requestor is an investigator with the Texas Board of Nursing (the "board"). Section 411.125 of the Government Code provides:

The [board] is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to a person who:

- (1) is an applicant for or the holder of a license issued by the board;
- (2) has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board; or
- (3) is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge against the person.

Gov't Code § 411.125. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). “Criminal history record information” (“CHRI”) is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, under section 411.125, the board may have a right of access to CHRI about the named individual contained in the department’s records.

Accordingly, if the named individual is an applicant for a license from the board, a holder of a license from the board, has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board, or is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge, then the requestor is authorized to obtain the named individual’s CHRI contained in the submitted information pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .082(2), .125(a). We note a specific statutory right of access overcomes the general exceptions in the Act, such as section 552.108. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act), 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Thus, if any of these conditions are met, the department must make available to the requestor CHRI under section 411.087. In that instance, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information

under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, if the individual who is named as the arrested person in the report does not meet any of the criteria in subsection 411.125(1)-(3), then the board does not have a special right of access to the CHRI under section 411.087. In that event, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We note the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form contain information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.³

In summary, if the board has a right of access pursuant to sections 411.125 and 411.087(a) of the Government Code, the department must make available to the requestor CHRI under section 411.087, but, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. If the board does not have a right of access pursuant to sections 411.125 and 411.087 then, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and DIC-25 form and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Paige Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 518481

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)