



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 31, 2014

Ms. Cecilia Gamez
Crime Records Office
McAllen Police Department
P.O. Box 220
McAllen, Texas 78501

OR2014-05309

Dear Ms. Gamez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 520176.

The McAllen Police Department (the "department") received a request for any reports involving two named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

¹Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, you make no argument to support this exception. Therefore, we presume you no longer assert this exception. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note, however, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. This office has also found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See generally* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-10 (1992), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Whether the public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* ORD 373.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individuals named in the request, thus implicating the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted reports that do not depict either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, these reports are not part of a criminal history compilation and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis. However, we note portions of these reports satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, we conclude the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. As such, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 on this basis.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We conclude the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.³

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states, "Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for the purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). Accordingly, the department must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136.⁴

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

⁴We note section 552.136(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the information described in section 552.136(b). Gov't Code § 552.136(c); *see also id.* § 552.136(d)-(e) (requestor may appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information under section 552.136(c) to attorney general and governmental body withholding information pursuant to section 552.136(c) must provide certain notice to requestor).

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Lindsay E. Hale". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the printed name.

Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/akg

Ref: ID# 520176

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)