



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 2, 2014

Mr. Daniel Ortiz
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2014-05431

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 518965 (El Paso Request ID# 14-1026-4005).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to incidents occurring at a specified address involving the requestor and two named individuals from a specified period of time. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You claim report number 12-219295 is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state incident report number 12-219295 relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of report number 12-219295 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ.

App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report number 12-219295.

Next, you claim report numbers 12-036155, 12-175151, and 12-186031 are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state report numbers 12-036155, 12-175151, and 12-186031 relate to investigations that were never prosecuted. Thus, you state the information at issue relates to closed cases that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we find that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to report numbers 12-036155, 12-175151, and 12-186031.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report number 12-219295 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and report numbers 12-036155, 12-175151, and 12-186031 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrines of common-law privacy and constitutional privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683.

Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding

¹As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure, except to note basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Furthermore, we find the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information falls within the constitutional zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report number 12-219295 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and report numbers 12-036155, 12-175151, and 12-186031 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/tch

Ref: ID# 518965

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)