



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 22, 2014

Ms. Renae Mayfield
Custodian of Records
Kaufman County Sheriff's Office
1900 E. U.S. Highway 175
Kaufman, Texas 75142

OR2014-06501

Dear Ms. Mayfield:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 520195.

The Kaufman County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual from a specified time period. You state the sheriff's office has released some of the requested information. We understand the sheriff's office has redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."² Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects

¹We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov't Code § 411.082 (2)(B)* (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

Upon review, we find the present request requires the sheriff's office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. Accordingly, we find the request implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, you have submitted a report which pertains to a routine traffic violation. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual. Thus, report number 2014-00133 may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy as a criminal history compilation.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]

Id. § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (b)(1). We note the protections offered by subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(b)(1) are, generally, mutually exclusive of section 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(1) protects information, the release of which would interfere with a particular pending criminal investigation or prosecution, while section 552.108(b)(1) encompasses internal law enforcement and prosecution records, the release of which would interfere with law enforcement and prosecution efforts in general. In contrast, section 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the exception it claims is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You argue report number 2014-00133 should be withheld because “the disclosure of the evidence requested would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of [the case].” However, you also claim the report relates to an investigation that “did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication.” Based on these conflicting representations, we are unable to determine if report number 2014-00133 relates to an ongoing criminal case or a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1), 552.108(a)(2), or 552.108(b)(1) to report number 2014-00133; therefore, no portion of report number 2014-00133 may be withheld under any of these bases.

We understand the sheriff’s office has redacted specific information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.³ However, you have failed to mark some of the remaining information that is subject to section 552.130. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DLW/akg

Ref: ID# 520195

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)