



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 29, 2014

Mr. Daniel Ortiz
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P. O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2014-07115

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 520976.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). We find the submitted information involves allegations of juvenile conduct in violation of a penal statute that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.*, § 51.03(a), (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). We note, however, the requestor is the parent of the juvenile offender. Therefore, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning the juvenile pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your claims under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find portions of the narrative meet the standard articulated by the Texas supreme court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, as noted above, the requestor is a parent of the juvenile with a privacy interest. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her child’s information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987)(privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself.) Further, the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the basic

information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/eb

Ref: ID# 520976

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)