



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 13, 2014

Ms. Michelle T. Rangel
Assistant County Attorney
Fort Bend County
401 Jackson Street, 3rd Floor
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2014-08083

Dear Ms. Rangel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 522366.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for call slips, offense reports, and Child Protective Services case information pertaining to a specified address and three named individuals from a specified period of time. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, requires the sheriff's office to compile the named individuals' criminal history and implicates the named individuals' right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records listing the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments regarding disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under

this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state some of the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree the information we have marked is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of Family Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). As you do not indicate the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.² *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the information at issue pertains to closed cases that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information we have marked.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

You claim some of the basic information is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas

²As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

³As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. 540 S.W.2d at 683. Upon review, we find the information we have marked in the basic information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the remaining basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records listing the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. In releasing basic information, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining basic information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/tch

Ref: ID# 522366

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)