



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

May 14, 2014

Mr. James Kopp  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of San Antonio  
P.O. Box 839966  
San Antonio, Texas 78283

OR2014-08189

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 522683 (ORR# W024704).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for a specified case number. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not pertain to the requested case number. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the city is not required to release such information in response to this request.

Next, we note the responsive information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides, with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report the Office of the Attorney General ("OAG") determines is privileged, the OAG shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). The format of the report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but any other documents submitted with the revised report are

confidential under article 49.18(b). You seek to withhold the custodial death report under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, section 49.18 makes custodial death reports expressly public. Information that is specifically made public by statute may not be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S. W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, the public's right of access to the custodial death report and summary prevails over common-law privacy, and the submitted custodial death report and summary may not be withheld on that basis. Therefore, the city must release the submitted custodial death report and summary, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82.

The remaining responsive information consists of a report of alleged sexual assault. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). The requestor in this case knows the identity of the alleged victim of sexual assault. We believe in this instance, withholding only identifying information from within the report of alleged sexual assault would not preserve the victim's common-law right to privacy. Therefore, we conclude the city must withhold the remaining responsive information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must release the submitted custodial death report and summary, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The city must withhold the remaining responsive information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 522683

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)