



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

May 27, 2014

Mr. Keith R. Bradford  
Assistant County Attorney  
Nacogdoches County  
101 West Main Street, Room 230  
Nacogdoches, Texas 75961

OR2014-09032

Dear Mr. Bradford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 523815.

The Nacogdoches County District Attorney's Office and the Nacogdoches County Sheriff's Office (collectively, the "county") each received a request from the same requestor for six categories of information pertaining to a specified case, specified training requirements, and specified operating procedures. You state you have released some of the requested information marked as Exhibit C to the requestor with redactions made pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> The county asserts some of the submitted information is not subject to the Act. You claim that the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.140 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the submitted information contains peace officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers.

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officers' TCOLE identification numbers in the information at issue do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state Exhibit D pertains to a criminal investigation where criminal charges were dismissed. Thus, you state Exhibit D relates to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree you may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under

the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of medical records subject to the MPA. Accordingly, the county must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) The [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a)-(b). Therefore, the county must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms in Exhibit F under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

*Id.* § 1701.454. The remaining information contains an F-5 Report of Separation of Licensee. The information at issue does not indicate the officer at issue resigned or was terminated for reasons other than substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the county must withhold the submitted F-5 report, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. However, we find none of the remaining information at issue is confidential under section 1701.454. Therefore, we conclude the county may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement with the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI. The county must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides that "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a

governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *See id.* § 560.003; *see also id.* §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Upon review, we find the fingerprints we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See generally* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). However, there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* Open Decision Nos. 600 at 9 (1992) (employee’s designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (financial information pertaining to receipt of funds from governmental body or debts owed to governmental body not protected by common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has found the public has a legitimate interest in information relating to applicants and employees of governmental bodies and their employment qualifications and job performance, especially where the applicant was seeking a position in law enforcement. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 (1986), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the county must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts*

*v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Having carefully reviewed the information at issue, we find the county must withhold the dates of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

We understand you have redacted some of the information at issue subject to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code in conjunction with Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001).<sup>4</sup> Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 of the Government Code or section 552.1175 of the Government Code.<sup>5</sup> Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone or pager number, unless the cellular or pager service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-7 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). We also note section 552.117 is not applicable to a former spouse or the fact that a government employee has been divorced. Additionally, an individual's personal post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117 and therefore may not be withheld under section 552.117. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 6 (1994) (purpose of section 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 658 at 4 (1998) (statutory confidentiality provision must be express and cannot be implied). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117(a)(2). Therefore, the county must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the county may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers if the cellular service is not paid for by a governmental body.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the county must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected,

---

<sup>4</sup>Open Records Decision No. 670 authorizes all governmental bodies to withhold the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone and pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

<sup>5</sup>"Peace officer" is defined by Article 2.12 of the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure.

assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”<sup>6</sup> *Id.* § 552.136(b). This office has determined that insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Therefore, the county must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the owner of the e-mail address consents to its release or the e-mail address falls within the scope of section 552.137(c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 is not applicable to the work e-mail address of an employee of a governmental body because such an address is not that of the employee as a “member of the public” but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. Accordingly, the county must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

Section 552.139(b)(3) of the Government Code provides, “a photocopy or other copy of an identification badge issued to an official or employee of a governmental body” is confidential. *Id.* § 552.139(b)(3). Therefore, the county must withhold the copy of the identification card, which we have marked, under section 552.139(b)(3) of the Government Code.

Section 552.140 of the Government Code provides a military veteran’s DD-214 form or other military discharge record that is first recorded with, or that otherwise first comes into the possession of, a governmental body on or after September 1, 2003, is confidential for a period of seventy-five years and may only be disclosed in accordance with section 552.140 or in accordance with a court order. *See id.* § 552.140(a)-(b). You state the county came into possession of the submitted DD-214 form after September 1, 2003. Thus, the county must withhold the submitted DD-214 form, which we have marked, under section 552.140 of the Government Code.

In summary, the TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The county may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The county must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code (1) the information we have marked in conjunction with the MPA, (2) the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms in Exhibit F in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, (3) the submitted F-5 report we have marked in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, (4) the CHRI we have marked in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law, (5) the fingerprints we have marked in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, and (6) the

---

<sup>6</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information we have marked in conjunction with common-law privacy. The county must withhold the dates of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The county must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the county may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers if the cellular service is not paid for by a governmental body. The county must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The county must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The county must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The county must withhold the copy of the identification card, which we have marked, under section 552.139(b)(3) of the Government Code. The county must withhold the submitted DD-214 form, which we have marked, under section 552.140 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Casterline', with a large, stylized flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/bhf

Ref: ID# 523815

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)