



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 28, 2014

Ms. Savannah Gonzalez
Assistant District Attorney
Hidalgo County
100 North Closner, Room 303
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2014-09099

Dear Ms. Gonzalez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 523944 (Hidalgo File Nos. 2014-0024-DA and 2014-0025-DA).

The Hidalgo County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received two requests for information regarding a former employee. You state the sheriff's office has made some information available to the requestors. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.117 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number.² In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is

¹Although you raise section 552.1175 of the Government Code, we note section 552.117 of the Government Code is the appropriate exception to raise for information the sheriff's office holds in an employment capacity.

²The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement by the 83rd Legislature. See Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestors.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) ("biometric identifier" means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). We note the fingerprints you seek to withhold belong to a deceased individual. Laws making this type of information confidential are intended to protect an individual's privacy. *See id.* Because the right of privacy is purely personal and lapses at death, the fingerprints of a deceased individual may not be withheld on the basis of sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters. Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.) (right of privacy

is purely personal and lapses upon death); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-67 (N.D. Tex. 1979); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the submitted fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes medical records subject to the MPA. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold these records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in accordance with the MPA. We note the remaining information includes a report of the results of a drug test. Section 159.001 of the MPA defines "patient" as "a person who, to receive medical care, consults with or is seen by a physician." Occ. Code § 159.001(3). Because the individual at issue in the report did not receive medical care in the administration of the drug test, this individual is not a patient for purposes of section 159.002. Additionally, we find none of the remaining information constitutes a medical record subject to the MPA, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.306 makes confidential L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by TCOLE. Former section 1701.306 provides, in part:

(a) [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCOLE]. A declaration is not public information.

Act of May 17, 1999, 76th Leg., R.S., ch. 388, § 1, 1999 Tex. Gen. Laws 1431, 2219 (current version at Occ. Code § 1701.306(a), (b)). Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The remaining information includes information that was submitted to TCOLE pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Furthermore, the information at issue does not indicate the officer resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

³We note the L-2 and L-3 declaration forms at issue were created prior to September 1, 2011. Although section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code was amended in 2011 by the 82nd Legislature, L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011 are subject to the former version of section 1701.306, which was continued in effect for that purpose.

Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. In this instance, however, we note the information at issue pertains to an individual who is deceased. As previously noted, the right to privacy lapses at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229; H-917. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code based upon the privacy interests of the deceased individual. Additionally, we find no portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]" Gov't Code § 552.102(a). We understand you to assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test under section 552.101 of the Government Code, which is discussed above. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers, Inc.*, 652 S.W.2d 546, 549-51 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the court of appeals ruled the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court expressly disagreed with *Hubert's* interpretation of section 552.102(a), and held the privacy standard under section 552.102(a) differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. *See Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court also considered the applicability of section 552.102(a) and held it excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *See id.* at 348. However, we note section 552.102(a) protects the privacy interests of individuals, and, as noted above, the right to privacy lapses at death. *See Moore*, 587 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229; H-917. Upon review, we find none of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family

member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Gov't Code § 552.117(a). We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). We also note a post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of Gov't Code § 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home). As noted above, the employee whose personal information is at issue is deceased. Because the protection afforded by section 552.117 includes "current or former" officials or employees, we note the protection generally does not lapse at death, as it is also intended to protect the privacy of the employee's family members and emergency contacts. We note, however, because the protection of social security numbers under section 552.117 is intended solely to protect the privacy of the employee, it lapses at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229; H-917. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may only be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former official or employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. You state the employee at issue timely made a request for confidentiality pursuant to section 552.024. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the sheriff's office may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code the following: (1) the CHRI we have marked in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code, (2) the medical records we have marked in conjunction with the MPA, (3) the L-2 and L-3 declaration forms we have marked in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, and (4) the F-5 form we have marked under section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the sheriff's office may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The sheriff's office must release the remaining responsive information.⁴

⁴We note the remaining responsive information contains social security numbers of living individuals. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/tch

Ref: ID# 523944

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Two Requestors
(w/o enclosures)