



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 16, 2014

Ms. Victoria Johnson
Interim Assistant General Counsel
Dallas Area Rapid Transit
P.O. Box 660163
Dallas, Texas 75266-0163

OR2014-10312

Dear Ms. Johnson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 525913.

Dallas Area Rapid Transit ("DART") received a request for police reports filed on a specified date. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Law enforcement records relating to juvenile conduct, whether delinquent conduct or conduct in need of supervision, that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct in need of supervision” for purposes of title 3 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we agree a portion of the submitted information consists of records involving allegations of juveniles engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct in need of supervision occurring after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 of the Family Code apply to this information. Thus, the incident reports we have marked are confidential under section 58.007(c), and DART must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. Upon review, we find the information we have marked in report number 14000725 satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, DART must withhold the information we have marked in report number 14000725 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the remaining information at issue in report number 14000725 is not highly intimate or embarrassing information of no legitimate public concern and may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of some of these reports.

prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report numbers 14000730, 14000731, and 14000736 pertain to pending criminal investigations and prosecutions. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the reports at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.— Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the report numbers 14000730, 14000731, and 14000736.

However, basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-8; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, DART may withhold report numbers 14000730, 14000731, and 14000736 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find DART must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, DART may withhold the report numbers 14000730, 14000731, and 14000736 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. DART must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. DART must release the remaining information.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/som

Ref: ID# 525913

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)