



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 7, 2014

Mr. Ronald D. Stutes  
For City of Palestine  
Potter Minton, P.C.  
110 North College  
Tyler, Texas 75702

OR2014-17928

Dear Mr. Stutes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 539518.

The City of Palestine (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for the performance evaluations of the city manager completed by members of the city council on a specified date. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit written comments regarding why information should or should not be released).

We note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(1) provides for the required public disclosure of "a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body[.]" unless it is excepted by section 552.108 of the Government Code or "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" *Id.* § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of completed evaluations, which are subject to section 552.022(a)(1) and must be released unless they are either excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code or are confidential under the Act or other law. You do not claim section 552.108. Although you assert this information is excepted from disclosure under the deliberative process privileged encompassed by section 552.111 of the Government Code, this section is discretionary and does not make

information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 470 at 7 (1987) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.111 deliberative process); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the city may not withhold the submitted evaluations under section 552.111. However, we note one of the evaluations contains information that is subject to section 552.137, which makes information confidential under the Act.<sup>1</sup> Thus, we will address the applicability of section 552.137 for this information.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address we have marked is not one of the types specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the city must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 unless the owner of the address affirmatively consents to its release. As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lindsay E. Hale  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LEH/akg

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Ref: ID# 539518

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)