



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 4, 2014

Ms. Judith A. Hargrove  
Counsel for Victoria Central Appraisal District  
Hargrove & Evans, LLP  
4425 Mopac South, Building 3, Suite 400  
Austin, Texas 78735

OR2014-22007

Dear Ms. Hargrove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 546929.

The Victoria Central Appraisal District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for sales validations for three specified properties for two specified years. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup> We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the requestor contends portions of the requested information were previously released to the public and are now in the public domain. The Act does not permit the selective disclosure of information. *See id.* §§ 552.007(b), .021; Open Records Decision No. 463 at 1-2 (1987). If information has been voluntarily released to any member of the public, then that exact same information may not subsequently be withheld from another

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007(a); Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). The requestor contends the requested information has already been released to the public on the "Sales Comp Grid" and the district seeks to withhold the "source documents" of this information. However, section 552.007 does not prohibit an agency from withholding similar types of information that are not the exact information that has been previously released. We note the submitted information is not the exact information that was previously released. Further, we note the district claims the information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code, which makes information confidential by law for purposes of section 552.007. *See* Gov't Code § 552.101; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 674 at 3 n.4 (2001) (mandatory exceptions). Therefore, we will consider the district's arguments for the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which states, in pertinent part:

(a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

Tax Code § 22.27(a). We understand the district is an "appraisal office" for purposes of section 22.27(a). You state the submitted information consists of surveys submitted to the district by property owners concerning the sale of their real property and were obtained based on promises of confidentiality. You state none of the exceptions in section 22.27(b) apply in this instance. *See id.* § 22.27(b). Based on the district's representations, we find the district must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Paige Thompson", written in a cursive style.

Paige Thompson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PT/eb

Ref: ID# 546929

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)