



January 14, 2015

Ms. Amanda Speer
Assistant District Attorney
52nd Judicial District
County of Coryell
P.O. Box 919
Gatesville, Texas 76528

OR2015-00740

Dear Ms. Speer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 548144.

The Coryell County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to a murder case involving a named individual, including reports, statements, videos, and similar documents and exhibits.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.1085 of the Government Code and privileged under Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹We note the district attorney's office sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See Gov't Code* § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (if a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we note the district attorney's office has only submitted crime scene photographs and notes pertaining to the specified case. To the extent information responsive to the remainder of the request existed on the date the district attorney's office received the request, we assume you have released it. *See* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible). If you have not released any such information, you must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302.

Next, we must address the district attorney's office's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See id.* § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). In this instance, you state the district attorney's office received the request for information on July 7, 2014. You further state the district attorney's office sought clarification of the request and received clarification from the requestor on July 23, 2014. *See City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (if a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed). Accordingly, the district attorney's office's ten-business-day deadline was August 6, 2014. However, the envelope containing the district attorney's office's request for a ruling bears a meter-mark of October 17, 2014. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the district attorney's office failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Normally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). You assert portions of the submitted information are privileged under Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5. However, this rule is discretionary in nature and may be waived, and, thus, does not provide a compelling reason to withhold information under section 552.302. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 677 at 10 (2002) (attorney work-product privilege under Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5 is not compelling reason to withhold information under section 552.302). Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold the information at issue under Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5. However, because section 552.101 and

section 552.1085 can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will address their applicability to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides as follows:

(a) The medical examiner shall keep full and complete records properly indexed, giving the name if known of every person whose death is investigated, the place where the body was found, the date, the cause and manner of death, and shall issue a death certificate. . . . The records may not be withheld, subject to a discretionary exception under Chapter 552, Government Code, except that a photograph or x-ray of a body taken during an autopsy is excepted from required public disclosure in accordance with Chapter 552, Government Code, but is subject to disclosure:

(1) under a subpoena or authority of other law; or

(2) if the photograph or x-ray is of the body of a person who died while in the custody of law enforcement.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.25, § 11(a). You state some of the submitted photographs are confidential pursuant to section 11 of article 49.25. We note, however, the photographs at issue are not autopsy photographs, but rather photographs taken of the crime scene. Because the photographs taken at the crime scene are not autopsy photographs, article 49.25 is not applicable to these photographs and they may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.1085 of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part, the following:

(c) A sensitive crime scene image in the custody of a governmental body is confidential and excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 and a governmental body may not permit a person to view or copy the image except as provided by this section. This section applies to any sensitive crime scene image regardless of the date that the image was taken or recorded.

Gov't Code § 552.1085(c). For purposes of section 552.1085, "sensitive crime scene image" means "a photograph or video recording taken at a crime scene, contained in or part of a closed criminal case, that depicts a deceased person in a state of dismemberment, decapitation, or similar mutilation or that depicts the deceased person's genitalia." *See id.* § 552.1085(a)(6). Upon review, we find none of the submitted information consists of sensitive crime scene images for purposes of section 552.1085 of the Government Code, and

none of it may be withheld on that basis. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the district attorney's office must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lauren Dahlstein
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LMD/som

Ref: ID# 548144

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)