



January 15, 2015

Ms. Dolores Alvarado Hibbs  
General Counsel  
Texas Department of Agriculture  
P.O. Box 12847  
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2015-00865

Dear Ms. Hibbs:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 550360 (TDA-PIR-15-144).

The Texas Department of Agriculture (the "department") received a request for any correspondence between the department and Targeted J4T Management Company, LLC ("Targeted") concerning the allocation of funds by Targeted under the J4T Program, any correspondence between any joint venture capital firms selected by the department to administer portions of the J4T Program and Targeted concerning the allocation of funds to Targeted under the J4T Program, and any correspondence between the department, any joint venture capital firm selected by the department to administer portions of the J4T Program, and/or Targeted concerning an investment in a specified project. Although you take no position as to whether the requested information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the information may implicate the proprietary interests of Targeted. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified this third party of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental

body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.<sup>1</sup>

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Targeted explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Targeted has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Targeted may have in the information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under

---

<sup>1</sup>We note, and you acknowledge, the department has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason may exist to withhold information when the information affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). As such, because third-party interests can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure, we consider whether any of the information at issue may be withheld under on behalf of a third party. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

common-law privacy). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As no exception to disclosure is raised for the remaining information, it must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Daniel Olds  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DO/akg

Ref: ID# 550360

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. John D. Bray  
Elder Bray & Bankler PC  
755 East Mulberry Avenue, Suite 200  
San Antonio, Texas 78212  
(w/o enclosures)