



January 23, 2015

Ms. Christina Weber
Assistant City Attorney
City of Arlington
P.O. Box 90231
Arlington, Texas 76004-3231

OR2015-01349

Dear Ms. Weber:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 552535 (Arlington ID# W017914-110714).

The City of Arlington (the "city") received a request for the disciplinary history of a named city police officer, including internal affairs investigations. You state the city will release some of the requested information upon the requestor's response to a cost estimate. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record." Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Exhibit D contains a court-filed document, which we have marked, that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(17) and must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Record Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Accordingly, the city may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code under section 552.108. Portions of the court-filed document are subject

to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ As section 552.130 makes information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the court-filed document. Further, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Exhibit B contains CR-3 accident report forms completed pursuant to Chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer’s accident report). Section 550.065(b) states, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. In this instance, the requestor has not provided the city with the requisite pieces of information pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4). Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted CR-3 reports in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. However, we find the remaining information in Exhibit B does not consist of accident report forms; thus, the city may not withhold this information, which we have marked for release, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The city asserts the information in Exhibit C is confidential under section 58.007(c). Upon review, we find the information we marked consists of law enforcement records involving juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision occurring after September 1, 1997, and is, therefore, subject to section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). None of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the information we marked is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information in Exhibit C consists of internal investigation records of the named officer pertaining to a complaint against the officer. Records of an internal investigation do not constitute juvenile law enforcement records for the purposes of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Therefore, the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile offenders. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1).

A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution). You state Exhibit D pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of Exhibit D would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable to the remaining information in Exhibit D.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must release the court-filed document we marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the court-filed document, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Paige Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 552535

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)