



February 3, 2015

Ms. Delietrice Henry  
Open Records Assistant  
City of Plano  
P.O. Box 860358  
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2015-02116

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 552618 (ORR# NEWT110714).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for all offense/arrest reports and related records, including for a specified arrest, pertaining to a named individual. You state the department has provided some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore, does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The information submitted as Exhibit C was used or developed in investigations by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Thus, we find the information at issue is within the scope of section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we find the information in Exhibit C is generally confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

However, the requestor is a representative of the Probation and Pretrial Service Office (the “probation office”) of the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Texas (the “court”). Section 261.201 provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] any criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [DPS] about a person.” Gov’t Code § 411.089(a); *see also id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (providing DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [DPS CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

*Id.* § 411.087(a)(2). We note CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests,

detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). A criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Section 411.082 defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines “administration of criminal justice” as the “performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1). In this instance, the requestor states the probation office is conducting a presentence investigation of the named individual for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code on behalf of the court. Thus, we find the probation office is engaged in the administration of criminal justice for purposes of chapter 411. Therefore, the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(a), Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2).

The requestor states she intends to use the CHRI for criminal justice purposes. However, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Accordingly, if the department determines release of the CHRI is consistent with the Family Code, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from Exhibit C and must withhold any remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. We note that although the CHRI at issue may be subject to common-law privacy, a specific statutory right of access prevails over the common-law. *See CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Road*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common-law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). However, if the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, the department must withhold the information in Exhibit C in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (k) (listing entities authorized to receive 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy,

both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The request, in part, requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. We find such a request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, other than for the arrest specified in the request, the department must generally withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, as previously discussed, the requestor has a right of access under chapter 411 of the Government Code to portions of this information, to the extent it exists. *See Gov't Code* § 411.087(a)(2). Therefore, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, other than for the arrest specified in the request, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from those records that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint*, 436 F.3d at 544. To the extent it exists, the department must withhold any remaining information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, other than for the arrest specified in the request, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You have submitted incident report number 2014-00094763, which pertains to the arrest specified in the request. As this portion of the request does not require the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records, common-law privacy is not applicable, and the department may not withhold this information on that basis. However, we will address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” *Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted incident report number 2014-00094763 pertains to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation and

prosecution. Based on your representation, we conclude release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report number 2014-00094763.

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may generally withhold incident report number 2014-00094763 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

As previously discussed, however, the requestor has a right of access under chapter 411 of the Government Code to portions of this information. *See* Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2). Therefore, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from incident report number 2014-00094763 that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information in incident report number 2014-00094763 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the department determines release of the CHRI in Exhibit C is consistent with the Family Code, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from Exhibit C and must withhold any remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, the department must withhold the information in Exhibit C in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. To the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, other than for the arrest specified in the request, the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from those records and withhold any remaining information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from incident report number 2014-00094763. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information in incident report number 2014-00094763 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Leah B. Wingerson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LBW/bhf

Ref: ID# 552618

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)