



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 3, 2015

Ms. Danielle R. Folsom
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Department
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2015-04191

Dear Ms. Folsom:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 555702 (Houston GC No. 21952).

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for (1) the current corrective action log during a specified time period, (2) all safety reports and investigations from the city's Solid Waste Management Department during a specified time period, and (3) specified forms for five specified vehicles during a specified time period. You state you will make some information available to the requestor. You state you will redact information pursuant to sections 552.130(c), 552.136(c), and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

of the Government Code.² We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). We understand you to assert portions of the submitted information are confidential under common-law privacy on the basis of Open Records Decision No. 594 (1991), in which this office concluded public employees may have a privacy interest in their drug test results. *See* ORD 594 (suggesting identification of individual as having tested positive for use of illegal drug may raise privacy issues), 455 at 5 (1987) (citing *Shoemaker v. Handel*, 619 F. Supp. 1089 (D.N.J. 1985), *aff'd*, 795 F.2d. 1136 (3rd Cir. 1986)). We note some of the information at issue pertains to the results of drug and alcohol tests administered to city employees. As this office has explained on many occasions, information involving public officials and employees and public employment is generally not private because the public has a legitimate interest in such information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 473 at 3 (1987) (fact that public employee received less than perfect or even very bad evaluation not private), 470 at 4 (1987) (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs), 444 at 5 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for public employee's dismissal, demotion, or promotion), 405 at 2 (1983) (manner in which public employee's job was performed cannot be said to be of minimal public interest), 329 (1982) (reasons for employee's resignation ordinarily not private). Although the information at issue may be highly intimate or embarrassing, the public has a legitimate interest in the information. Therefore, we conclude the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the city must release the submitted information.

²We note, and the city acknowledges, the city did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(d), (e). Nonetheless, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider its applicability to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kenny Moreland', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Kenny Moreland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KJM/som

Ref: ID# 555702

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)