



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 17, 2015

Mr. Mark G. Daniel  
Counsel for the City of Watauga  
Evans, Daniel, Moore, Evans & Lazarus  
115 West Second Street, Suite 202  
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2015-05125

Dear Mr. Daniel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 556569 (PIR No. 14-574).

The Watauga Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for two specified incidents involving a named individual. You state the department will withhold motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You indicate the department will also withhold social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(a) A communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(b). You state the information in Exhibit B is confidential under section 773.091. Upon review, however, we find the information at issue does not contain a communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient. *See id.* § 773.091(a). The information at issue also does not contain a record of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that was created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider. *See id.* § 773.091(b). Consequently, the information in Exhibit B is not confidential under section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find some of the information in Exhibit B satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (b)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming sections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. In this instance, the department states it seeks to withhold the information in Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) and section 552.108(b)(2) as closed law enforcement records. However, the department also asserts this information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 because it pertains to a pending prosecution in Tarrant County. Based on the conflicting representations, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the applicability of subsections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2) to the information at issue; therefore, the department may not withhold Exhibit C on those bases.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Britni Fabian". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Britni Fabian  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

BF/bhf

Ref: ID# 556569

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)