



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 20, 2015

Mr. Robert Martinez
Director
Environmental Law Division
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

OR2015-05395

Dear Mr. Martinez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 557060 (TCEQ PIR: 15-19962).

The Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (the "commission") received a request for a specified Permit By Rule issued to EnAqua Solutions, LLC ("EnAqua"). You state you have made a portion of the information available to the requestor. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of EnAqua. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation demonstrating, you notified EnAqua of the request and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to it should be withheld from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code

§ 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, EnAqua has not submitted to this office any reasons explaining why the requested information should not be released. Thus, we have no basis for concluding any portion of the submitted information constitutes proprietary information of EnAqua, and the commission may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on that basis. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses section 382.041 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides, in part, “a member, employee, or agent of the commission may not disclose information submitted to the commission relating to secret processes or methods of manufacture or production that is identified as confidential when submitted.” Health & Safety Code § 382.041(a). This office has concluded section 382.041 protects information that is submitted to the commission if a *prima facie* case is established the information constitutes a trade secret under the definition set forth in the Restatement of Torts and if the submitting party identified the information as being confidential when submitting it to the commission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 652 (1997). The commission states EnAqua marked portions of the submitted information as confidential when EnAqua provided the submitted information to the commission.¹ Thus, the submitted information is confidential under section 382.041 to the extent it constitutes a trade secret. However, as noted above, EnAqua has not submitted arguments to this office explaining how any of the submitted information constitutes a trade secret. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any of this information constitutes a trade secret. *See id.* § 552.110; ORDs 552 at 5, 542 at 3. Consequently, the commission may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 382.041 of the Health and Safety Code. As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the commission must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹We note information is ordinarily not confidential under the Act simply because the party submitting the information requests that it be kept confidential. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 677 (Tex. 1976). In other words, a governmental body cannot, through an agreement or contract, overrule or repeal provisions of the Act. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987); Open Records Decision Nos. 541 at 3 (1990) (“[T]he obligations of a governmental body under [the Act] cannot be compromised simply by its decision to enter into a contract.”), 203 at 1 (1978) (mere expectation of confidentiality by person supplying information does not satisfy requirements of statutory predecessor to section 552.110).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ellen Webking
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EW/akg

Ref: ID# 557060

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Fred Toney
EnAqua Solutions, LLC
2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 3880
Dallas, Texas 75201-2708
(w/o enclosures)