



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 1, 2015

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
Office of the City Attorney
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2015-06151

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 558515.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for five categories of information regarding any incident in which a law enforcement officer employed by the department discharged a firearm resulting in injury or death of a person during a specified time period. You state the department will release some of the requested information. You indicate the department will redact certain information pursuant to the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 (2012).¹ You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 authorizes the department to withhold FBI numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code without requesting a decision under the Act when requests for such numbers are not made by individuals or entities who are authorized to obtain them under chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to law enforcement records of juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Exhibit 2 pertains to juvenile suspects who were ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the incidents that are the subject of the reports at issue. Further, the report involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. You do not inform us, and it does not appear, any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to the information at issue. Therefore, Exhibit 2 is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10–12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a

criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Upon review, we find none of the remaining information to be CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). However, we note the public has a legitimate interest in knowing the details of a crime. *See Lowe v. Hearst Communications, Inc.*, 487 F.3d 246, 250 (5th Cir. 2007) (noting a “legitimate public interest in facts tending to support an allegation of criminal activity” (citing *Cinel v. Connick*, 15 F.3d 1338, 1345-46 (1994))). Further, this office has found a compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note the common-law right to privacy is a personal right that “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded.” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Thus, information pertaining solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find none of the remaining information to be highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public

interest. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175(b). Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to "peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]" *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1). We note section 552.1175 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Thus, to the extent the information at issue relates to licensed peace officers who elect to restrict access to their information and the cellular telephone service at issue is not paid for by a governmental body, the department must withhold the information you have marked, along with the information we have marked, under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. If any of the individuals whose information is at issue are not currently licensed peace officers or do not elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), or the cellular telephone service at issue is paid for by a governmental body, the marked information pertaining to those individuals may not be withheld under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We note section 552.130 protects privacy, which is a personal right that lapses at death. *Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *Justice*, 472 F. Supp. at 146-47; Attorney General Opinions JM-229, H-917; ORD 272 at 1. Thus, section 552.130 is not applicable to the driver's license of a deceased individual. Upon review, we find a portion of the information you have marked is not subject to section 552.130. That information, which we have marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.130. However, we find the department must withhold the remaining information you have marked, along with the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.147. Upon review, we find the department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold Exhibit 2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information

at issue relates to licensed police officers who elect to restrict access to their information and the cellular telephone service at issue is not paid for by a governmental body, the department must withhold the information you have marked, along with the information we have marked, under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the information you have marked, along with the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Megan G. Holloway
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MGH/cbz

Ref: ID# 558515

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)