



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 2, 2015

Ms. A. Feliz Abalos  
Police Legal Advisor  
Senior Assistant City Attorney  
City of Odessa  
P.O. Box 4398  
Odessa, Texas 79760-4398

OR2015-06309

Dear Ms. Abalos:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 558544.

The Odessa Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name, date of birth, and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A)(C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005, and provides:

- (a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005, if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, the information at issue pertains to an alleged violation of section 32.51. We note the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. We further note the requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft listed in the submitted information. Therefore, the submitted information is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent that it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. Although you claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code are confidentiality provisions, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides, in relevant part:

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

*Id.* § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *Id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves alleged delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct”). However, we are unable to determine the age of the suspect at issue. Therefore, we must rule conditionally.

If the suspect was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue, then the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. As previously noted, however, article 2.29(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides the requestor with a right of access to this information. But article 2.29(b) also states “[i]n providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, *other than the information described by Subsection (a).*” Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29(b) (emphasis added). Accordingly, the department is authorized by article 2.29(b) to withhold most of the submitted information pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code as confidential information. However, because article 2.29(b) provides the requestor with a right of access to the information described in article 2.29(a), which is also subject to section 58.007(c), there is a conflict between the provisions of section 58.007(c) and article 2.29(b) with regard to the information described by article 2.29(a). Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision, unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See Gov’t Code* § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref’d n.r.e.).

In this instance, although section 58.007(c) of the Family Code generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, article 2.29(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure

specifically requires release of particular information in a report alleging a violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code to the victim listed in the report. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29; Fam. Code § 58.007. In addition, article 2.29 was enacted in a later legislative session than section 58.007(c). *See* Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(a), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885 (enacting article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure); Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, §§ 53, 100, 106, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517 (enacting section 58.007(c) of the Family Code). Therefore, notwithstanding the provisions of section 58.007(c), the department must release the information listed in article 2.29(a) to the requestor pursuant to article 2.29(b). The department must withhold the remaining information in the report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, if the suspect was under ten years of age or seventeen years of age or older at the time of the conduct, then the submitted information is not confidential under section 58.007(c) and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. In that situation, we find portions of the submitted information are otherwise excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code. § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the suspect was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue, then, except for the information listed in article 2.29(a) of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which must be released to this requestor,<sup>2</sup> the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. If the suspect was under ten years of age or seventeen years of age or older at the time of the conduct, then the submitted information is not confidential under section 58.007(c) and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. In that instance, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup>Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released in this instance, the department must request another ruling from this office should it receive another request for this information from a different requestor.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Lee Seidlits", with a stylized flourish extending to the right.

Lee Seidlits  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CLS/som

Ref: ID# 558544

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)