



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 8, 2015

Ms. Catelyn H. Kostbar
Administrative Technician III
Harris County Appraisal District
P.O. Box 920975
Houston, Texas 77292-0975

OR2015-06732

Dear Ms. Kostbar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 559132 (HCAD Internal Reference No. 15-10117).

The Harris County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for information related to a specified district account over a specified time period.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."

¹We note the district failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b) (requiring governmental body to ask for ruling and state exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving written request), (e) (requiring governmental body to submit within fifteen business days of receiving request for information comments explaining applicability of raised exceptions, copy of request for information, signed statement of date governmental body received request or evidence sufficient to establish date, and copy of information governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples). Nonetheless, the district's claims under sections 552.101 and 552.149 can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness caused by failure to comply with section 552.301. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302. Thus, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information, notwithstanding the district's violation of section 552.301 in requesting this decision.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which provides the following:

(a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

Tax Code § 22.27(a). We understand the district is an "appraisal office" for purposes of section 22.27(a). You state the information you have marked was provided to the district by the property owner in connection with an appraisal of the owner's property pursuant to section 22.27(a). You indicate none of the exceptions in section 22.27(b) apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the district must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code.³

Section 552.149 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of [the Act].

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the property owner or the owner's agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser of the applicable appraisal district a copy of each item of information described by Section 41.461(a)(2), Tax Code, and a copy of each item of information that the chief appraiser took into consideration but does not plan to introduce at the hearing on the protest. In addition, the property owner or agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser comparable sales data from a reasonable number of sales

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

that is relevant to any matter to be determined by the appraisal review board at the hearing on the property owner's protest[.]

Gov't Code § 552.149(a)-(b). Subsections 552.149(a) and (b) are limited to those counties having a population of 50,000 or more. *Id.* § 552.149(e). We note Harris County has a population of 50,000 or more. You state the information you have marked consists of information related to real property sales, descriptions, and characteristics, and it was obtained from private entities. You indicate the information at issue does not contain information to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.149(b). *See id.* § 552.149(b). Based on your representations and our review, we find the district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code. The district must withhold the information you marked under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,


Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 559132

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)