



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 10, 2015

Mr. R. Brooks Moore
Managing Counsel, Governance
The Texas A&M University System
301 Tarrow Street, 6th Floor
College Station, Texas 77840-7896

OR2015-06915

Dear Mr. Moore:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 559638 (TAMU 15-059).

Texas A&M University (the "university") received a request for information utilized in the teaching and evaluation of students relating to named courses. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 51.914 of the Education Code. Section 51.914(a)(1) reads as follows:

¹We assume the "representative samples" of records submitted to this office are truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee[.]

Educ. Code § 51.914(a)(1). As noted in Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997), the legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular scientific information has “a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee.” *See generally* ORD 651 at 9-10. Thus, this office has stated that in considering whether requested information has “a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee,” we will rely on a governmental body’s assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.* However, a governmental body’s determination that information has a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee is subject to judicial review. *See id.*

You claim Exhibit B is confidential under section 51.914(a)(1) of the Education Code. You state the Benz School of Floral Design, which is part of the university’s College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, developed the requested course materials and curriculum. You state the requested information is licensed for a fee to school districts. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude Exhibit B consists of a product developed by the university that has the potential to be licensed for a fee. Accordingly, the university must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code.

Section 552.122 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a] test item developed by an educational institution that is funded wholly or in part by state revenue[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.122(a). In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined the term “test item” in section 552.122 includes “any standard means by which an individual’s or group’s knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated.” *Id.* at 6. The question of whether specific information falls within the scope of section 552.122(a) must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* Traditionally, this office has applied section 552.122 where release of “test items” might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *Id.* at 4–5; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). Section 552.122 also protects the answers to test questions when the answers might reveal the questions themselves. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-640 at 3 (1987); ORD 626 at 8. You state the exam enclosed in Exhibit D consists of test items developed by the university. You state the university is funded in part by state revenue. You state you will continue to use these test items. Based on these representations and our review, we agree the university may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.122(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the university must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code. The university may also withhold Exhibit D under section 552.122(a) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Mili Gosar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/eb

Ref: ID# 559638

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)