



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 14, 2015

Mr. Keith R. Bradford
Assistant County Attorney
Nacogdoches County
101 West Main Street, Room 230
Nacogdoches, Texas 75961

OR2015-07122

Dear Mr. Bradford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 560253.

The Nacogdoches County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to 1) the arrest and prosecution of a named individual, 2) the arresting officer, and 3) training and procedures of the sheriff's office. The sheriff's office informs us some information does not exist.¹ The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, the sheriff's office states the submitted information contains a peace officer Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number.² In Open Records

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

²The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement by the 83rd Legislature. *See* Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we note the sheriff's office has redacted dates of birth from the submitted documents. The sheriff's office does not assert, nor does our review of the records indicate, the sheriff's office has been authorized to withhold this information without seeking a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). Therefore, information must be submitted in a manner that enables this office to determine whether the information comes within the scope of an exception to disclosure. Because we are able to discern the nature of the redacted information, we are not prevented from determining whether that information falls within the scope of the sheriff's office's exceptions to disclosure. Accordingly, we will address the sheriff's office's arguments with respect to the information at issue, including the redacted information. Nevertheless, we caution the sheriff's office that a failure to provide this office with requested information generally deprives us of the ability to determine whether information may be withheld and leaves this office with no alternative other than ordering the redacted information to be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body must provide this office with copy of specific information requested or representative sample if information is voluminous).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (Texas Peace Office's Accident Report form). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that, except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of accident reports to a person who provides at least two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) specific location of the accident; and (3) name of any person involved in the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* We note the submitted information includes accident reports completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. In this instance, the requestor did not provide the sheriff's office with two of the three requisite pieces of information. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must

withhold the submitted accident reports, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065 of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). The sheriff's office states Exhibit D pertains to an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to Exhibit D.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.-Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Part 20 of title 28 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement with criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record

information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find none of the remaining information consists of confidential CHRI under chapter 411, and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release the contents of a report or statement submitted under this subchapter.

Id. § 1701.454. Upon review, we find no portion of the remaining information is confidential pursuant to section 1701.454, and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office

has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. However, the sheriff's office has not demonstrated how any of the remaining information constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has also found common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile offenders. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Determinations under common-law privacy must be made on a case-by-case basis. *See* ORD 373 at 4; *Indus. Found.*, 540 S. W.2d at 685 (whether matter is of legitimate interest to public can be considered only in context of each particular case). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the sheriff's office has not demonstrated how any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern, and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held

section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining information is protected by section 552.102(a), and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it on that basis.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 or 552.1175 of the Government Code.³ Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117(a)(2) is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). But an individual's personal post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117, and therefore may not be withheld under section 552.117. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 6 (1994) (purpose of section 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 658 at 4 (1998) (statutory confidentiality provision must be express and cannot be implied). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the cellular telephone numbers we have marked may only be withheld if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. Further, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate how any of the remaining information is confidential under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has redacted, along with the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code and thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it on that basis.

In summary, the submitted TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The sheriff's office must withhold the submitted accident reports, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic

³Section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found in article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the cellular telephone numbers we have marked may only be withheld if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has redacted, along with the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/dls

Ref: ID# 560253

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)