



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 19, 2015

Ms. Anne M. Constantine
Legal Counsel
Dallas/Fort Worth International Airport Board
P.O. Box 619428
DFW Airport, Texas 75261-9428

OR2015-09678

Dear Ms. Constantine:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 564183.

The Dallas/Fort Worth International Airport Board (the "board") received four requests for information pertaining to a former employee, including his personnel file, daily observation reports, and employment application materials. You state the board will release some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, and 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the requested information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the TCOLE's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the requested information does not constitute

reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments under this section. We also will address the applicability of sections 552.102, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code to the submitted information.¹

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides the following:

(a) A polygraph examiner, trainee, or employee of a polygraph examiner, or a person for whom a polygraph examination is conducted or an employee of the person, may not disclose information acquired from a polygraph examination to another person other than:

- (1) the examinee or any other person specifically designated in writing by the examinee;
- (2) the person that requested the examination;
- (3) a member, or the member’s agent, of a governmental agency that licenses a polygraph examiner or supervises or controls a polygraph examiner’s activities;
- (4) another polygraph examiner in private consultation; or
- (5) any other person required by due process of law.

(b) The [Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation] or any other governmental agency that acquires information from a polygraph examination under this section shall maintain the confidentiality of the information.

(c) A polygraph examiner to whom information acquired from a polygraph examination is disclosed under Subsection (a)(4) may not disclose the information except as provided by this section.

Occ. Code § 1703.306. You seek to withhold polygraph information that is confidential under section 1703.306, and the requestors do not appear to have a right of access to the information under that section. Accordingly, the board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Id. § 1701.454. The submitted information contains an F-5 Report of Separation of Licensee. The report does not indicate the officer at issue resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Thus, the board must withhold the F-5 report you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code, which governs the public availability of mental health records and provides:

(a) Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

(b) Confidential communications or records may not be disclosed except as provided by Section 611.004 or 611.0045.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a)-(b); *see id.* § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Upon review, we find the information you marked under section 611.002 consists of mental health records. Therefore, the board must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides, in relevant part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any

individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual's name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the [Act].

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

Id. § 411.192(a)-(b). The information we have marked consists of concealed handgun license information obtained from DPS. In this instance, none of the requestors is the license holder or a criminal justice agency. Thus, the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Part 20 of title 28 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current

²As we reach this conclusion, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

involvement with criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked under chapter 411 constitutes confidential CHRI. Therefore, the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, we find no portion of the remaining information you have marked consists of confidential CHRI under chapter 411, and the board may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82.

Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office also has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). However, information concerning financial transactions between an employee and a public employer is generally of legitimate public interest. ORD 545. We further note information obtained by a law enforcement agency in the process of hiring a peace officer is a matter of legitimate public interest, and the public has a legitimate interest in information relating to those who are involved in law enforcement. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (1987) (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs), 473 at 3 (1987) (fact that public employee received less than perfect or even very bad evaluation not private), 444 at 3 (1986) (public has obvious interest in information concerning qualifications and performance of law enforcement employees), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow), 405 at 2 (1983) (manner in which public employee's job was performed cannot be said to be of minimal public interest).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find none of the remaining information at issue is confidential under common-law privacy, and the board may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we conclude the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address, home telephone number, personal pager and cellular telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 or 552.1175 of the Government Code.³ Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(2). Upon review, we conclude the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The board must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, (2) section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, and (3) section 611.002

³Section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found in article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

of the Health and Safety Code. The board must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 411.192 of the Government Code, (2) section 411.083 of the Government Code, and (3) common-law privacy. The board also must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.102(a), 552.117(a)(2), 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. The board must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 564183

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 4 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)