



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 22, 2015

Ms. P. Armstrong  
Ms. S. McClellan  
Assistant City Attorneys  
Criminal Law and Police Section  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2015-10026

Dear Ms. Armstrong and Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 564586 (ORR #2015-03683).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same law firm for 1) multiple categories of information pertaining to a specified incident, 2) multiple categories of information pertaining to two specified addresses, 3) specified policies, and 4) specified information pertaining to specified department employees. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have submitted information pertaining only to the first, second, and fourth categories of the request listed above. However, you have not submitted any information responsive to the third category of the requests. Although you state the department submitted a representative sample of the requested information, we find the submitted information is not representative of the third category of information to which the

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you do not raise section 552.147 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand the department to assert this exception based on your markings.

requestors seek access. Please be advised this open records letter ruling applies to only the types of information you have submitted for our review. This ruling does not authorize the department to withhold any information that is substantially different from the type of information you submitted to this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302. Therefore, to the extent information responsive to the third category of the requests exists and was maintained by the department on the date it received the requests, we assume the department has released it to the requestors. If the department has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *Id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (noting that if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible under circumstances).

Next, we note some of the submitted information is not responsive to the present request because it does not pertain to any of the requested categories of information specified by the requestor. This ruling does not address the public availability of the non-responsive information, which we have marked, and the department need not release it in response to this request.

Next, we note the submitted information includes officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers. In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand the officers' TCOLE identification numbers are a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the officers' TCOLE numbers do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the officers' TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

We note, and you acknowledge, some of the requested information was the subject of previous requests for rulings, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter Nos. 2015-08156 (2015) and 2015-08621 (2015). In Open Records Letter No. 2015-08156, we determined (1) the department must withhold the indicated information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, (2) the department must withhold the marked motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and (3) the department must release the remaining information. In Open Records Letter No. 2015-08621, we determined the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. We have no indication the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior rulings were based have changed. Thus, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter Nos. 2015-08156 and 2015-08621 as previous determinations and withhold or release the information at issue in accordance

with those rulings.<sup>2</sup> *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in a prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). However, we will consider your arguments for the submitted information not subject to the previous rulings.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the information we have marked involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.007(c). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.<sup>3</sup> However, we find the remaining information at issue does not involve a juvenile identified as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Therefore, we find that you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 58.007 to the remaining information at issue, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis.

You argue the marked dates of birth are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 32.51 of the Penal Code.<sup>4</sup> Section 32.51 of the Penal Code provides, in relevant part:

(b) A person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of:

(1) identifying information of another person without the other person's consent;

(2) information concerning a deceased natural person, including a stillborn infant or fetus, that would be identifying information of that person were that person alive, if the item of information is obtained, possessed, transferred, or used without legal authorization; or

(3) identifying information of a child younger than 18 years of age.

Penal Code § 32.51(b). "Identifying information" means "information that alone or in conjunction with other information identifies a person" and includes a person's date of birth. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A). You assert the marked dates of birth meet the definition of "identifying information" under section 32.51(a)(1)(A) of the Penal Code. However, section 32.51(b) does not prohibit the transfer of identifying information of another person unless the transfer is made "with the intent to harm or defraud another[.]" *See id.* § 32.51(b). In this instance, the department's release of the information at issue would be for the purpose of complying with the Act, and not with the intent to harm or defraud another. Therefore, section 32.51(b) of the Penal Code does not prohibit the department from transferring the requested information in this instance. Accordingly, we find the department may not withhold the marked dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 32.51 of the Penal Code.

---

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

<sup>4</sup>Although you argue the dates of birth are made confidential by section 32.52 of the Penal Code, we understand you to argue section 32.51 based on the substance of your argument.

You also argue the marked dates of birth are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 521.051 of the Business and Commerce Code. Section 521.051 of the Business and Commerce Code provides:

(a) A person may not obtain, possess, transfer, or use personal identifying information of another person without the other person's consent and with intent to obtain a good, a service, insurance, an extension of credit, or any other thing of value in the other person's name.

Bus. & Comm. Code § 521.051(a) (formerly Bus. & Comm. Code § 48.101(a)). "Personal identifying information" means "information that alone or in conjunction with other information identifies an individual" and includes an individual's date of birth. *Id.* § 521.002(a)(1)(A). You assert the marked dates of birth meet the definition of "personal identifying information" under section 521.002(a)(1) of the Business and Commerce Code. *See id.* § 521.002(a)(1). We note section 521.051(a) of the Business and Commerce Code does not prohibit the transfer of personal identifying information of another person unless the transfer is made with the intent to obtain a good, a service, insurance, an extension of credit, or any other thing of value in the other person's name without that person's consent. *See id.* § 521.051(a). As noted above, in this instance, the department's release of the information at issue would be for the purpose of complying with the Act, and not "with intent to obtain a good, a service, insurance, an extension of credit, or any other thing of value[.]" *See id.* Therefore, section 521.051(a) of the Business and Commerce Code does not prohibit the department from transferring the requested information. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the marked dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 521.051 of the Business and Commerce Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the

information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by someone under the supervision of a physician. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note, however, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b). We also note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate how the remaining information at issue consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides, “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) (“biometric identifier” means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). There is no indication the requestor has a right of access to the biometric identifier under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Accordingly, the department must withhold the biometric identifier you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). However, the public has a legitimate interest in knowing the details of a crime. *See Lowe v. Hearst Communications, Inc.*, 487 F.3d 246, 250 (5th Cir. 2007) (noting a “legitimate public interest in facts tending to support an allegation of criminal activity” (citing *Cinel v. Connick*, 15 F.3d 1338, 1345-46 (1994))). Determinations under common-law privacy must be made on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 373 at 4 (1983); *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685 (whether matter is of legitimate interest to public can be considered only in context of each particular case). Furthermore, the doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual’s criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). We also find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note dates of birth of members of the public are generally not highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 at 7 (1987) (home addresses, telephone numbers, dates of birth not protected under privacy). Upon review, we conclude the information we have marked meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find no portion of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern, and the department

may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the motor vehicle record information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). You state the employee identification numbers you have marked are used in conjunction with one additional digit to access credit union bank accounts. Thus, the department must withhold the employee identification numbers you have marked, and the employee identification numbers we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we agree the department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter Nos. 2015-08156 and 2015-08621 as previous determinations and withhold or release the information at issue in accordance with those rulings. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The department must withhold the biometric identifier you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the motor vehicle record information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the employee identification numbers you have marked, and the employee identification numbers we have marked, under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Meredith L. Coffman', with a long, sweeping underline that extends to the right.

Meredith L. Coffman  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MLC/dls

Ref: ID# 564586

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)