



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 12, 2015

Ms. Paige Mebane
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2015-11670

Dear Ms. Mebane:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 567144 (Fort Worth PIR No. W041457).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for specified reports relating to a specified address.¹ The department states it has released some of the requested information. We understand the department is redacting social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code and FBI numbers as permitted by Open Records Letter No. 2013-22304 (2013).² The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the

¹We note the department sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

²We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b). Open Records Letter No. 2013-22304 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing the department to withhold FBI numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law without requesting a ruling from this office.

Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). Section 58.007 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we conclude the information the department has indicated consists of law enforcement records involving juvenile delinquent conduct occurring after September 1, 1997, and is, therefore, subject to section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of section 58.007). None of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the information the department has indicated is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the information it has indicated relates to pending criminal prosecutions. Upon review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection,

investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information it has indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, we find the remaining information the department has marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate the information we have marked for release is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the department may not withhold the information we have marked for release under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We understand the department is redacting motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.⁴ However, we note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

⁴We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department (1) must withhold the information it has indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code; (2) with the exception of basic information, which must be released, may withhold the information it has indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; (3) with the exception of the information we have marked for release, must withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (4) must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DLW/bhf

Ref: ID# 567144

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)