



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 23, 2015

Ms. Josephine Ramirez-Solis  
Assistant District Attorney  
County of Hidalgo  
100 North Closner, Room 303  
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2015-12346

Dear Ms. Ramirez-Solis:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 568443 (PIR No. 2015-0028-DA.SO).

The Hidalgo County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for the personnel file of a named individual. You state the sheriff's office has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.111, and 552.117 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. In Open Records Decision No. 581(1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly,

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you raise section 552.1175 of the Government Code for information pertaining to a peace officer, we note section 552.117 is the proper exception to raise for information held in an employment context.

we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the confidentiality provisions found in chapter 55 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Articles 55.01 through 55.05 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provide for the expunction of criminal records in certain limited circumstances. Article 55.03 prescribes the effect of an expunction order and provides:

When the order of expunction is final:

- (1) the release, maintenance, dissemination, or use of the expunged records and files for any purpose is prohibited;
- (2) except as provided in Subdivision (3) of this article, the person arrested may deny the occurrence of the arrest and the existence of the expunction order; and
- (3) the person arrested or any other person, when questioned under oath in a criminal proceeding about an arrest for which the records have been expunged, may state only that the matter in question has been expunged.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 55.03. Article 55.04 imposes sanctions for violations of an expunction order and provides in part:

Sec. 1. A person who acquires knowledge of an arrest while an officer or employee of the state or of any agency or other entity of the state or any political subdivision of the state and who knows of an order expunging the records and files relating to that arrest commits an offense if he knowingly releases, disseminates, or otherwise uses the records or files.

*Id.* art. 55.04, § 1. This office has determined records subject to an expunction order are not subject to public disclosure under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 457 at 2 (1987) (governmental body prohibited from releasing or disseminating arrest records subject to expunction order, as "those records are not subject to public disclosure under the [Act]"). You contend portions of the submitted information are the subject of expunction orders, and you seek to withhold such information under article 55.03 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. However, you have not submitted a copy of the expunction order for the

submitted information. We nevertheless conclude to the extent the submitted information is the subject of an expunction order, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 55.03 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. To the extent the submitted information is not the subject of any expunction order, the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on the basis of article 55.03.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to the [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The submitted information contains F-5 Reports of Separation of Licensee. You state the individual was not terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the submitted F-5 reports, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. However, we find the remaining information at issue does not consist of information that was submitted to TCOLE pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]" Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]" Gov't Code § 552.111. This section encompasses the attorney work

product privilege found in Rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure. *City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351, 360 (Tex. 2000); Open Records Decision No. 677 at 4-8 (2002). Rule 192.5 defines work product as

(1) material prepared or mental impressions developed in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for a party or a party's representatives, including the party's attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees, or agents; or

(2) a communication made in anticipation of litigation or for trial between a party and the party's representatives or among a party's representatives, including the party's attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees or agents.

TEX. R. CIV. P. 192.5(a). A governmental body seeking to withhold information under this exception bears the burden of demonstrating the information was created or developed for trial or in anticipation of litigation by or for a party or a party's representative. TEX. R. CIV. P. 192.5; ORD 677 at 6-8. In order for this office to conclude the information was made or developed in anticipation of litigation, we must be satisfied that

a) a reasonable person would have concluded from the totality of the circumstances surrounding the investigation that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue; and b) the party resisting discovery believed in good faith that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue and [created or obtained the information] for the purpose of preparing for such litigation.

*Nat'l Tank Co. v. Brotherton*, 851 S.W.2d 193, 207 (Tex. 1993). A "substantial chance" of litigation does not mean a statistical probability, but rather "that litigation is more than merely an abstract possibility or unwarranted fear." *Id.* at 204; ORD 677 at 7.

Upon review, we find the sheriff's office has failed to establish the information in Exhibit D consists of material prepared, mental impressions developed, or a communication made in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for the sheriff's office or representatives of the sheriff's office. *See Nat'l Tank*, 851 S.W.2d at 206 (information created in ordinary course of business constitutes work product if agency demonstrates primary motivating purpose for preparation of information was in anticipation of litigation); *see also* ORD 677 at 7. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information in Exhibit D as attorney work product under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

You indicate some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure a peace officer's home address and telephone number, social security number,

emergency contact information, and family member information regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. To the extent the individual at issue is a currently licensed peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

If the individual is not a currently licensed peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code may apply to the information at issue. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, emergency contact information, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may only be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former official or employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. If the individual whose information at issue made a timely election under section 552.024, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1). Conversely, if the individual did not make a timely election under section 552.024, this information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. To the extent the submitted information is the subject of an expunction order, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 55.03 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. To the extent the individual at issue is a currently licensed peace officer as defined by article 2.12, the sheriff's office must withhold

the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. If the individual is not a currently licensed peace officer but made a timely election under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Behnke  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 568443

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)