



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 26, 2015

Ms. Stacie S. White
Counsel for the City of Saginaw
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107-4654

OR2015-12738

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 568729.

The City of Saginaw (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for reports related to calls to a specified address during a specified period of time and a specified report. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107(2), and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you state some of the requested information is subject to a court order of restricted access. We understand the order was entered in accordance with section 58.203 of the Family Code, which states the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") shall certify that juvenile law enforcement records are subject to automatic restriction of access under certain circumstances. Fam. Code § 58.203. Section 58.204(b) of the Family Code provides:

(b) On certification of records in a case under Section 58.203, the [DPS] may permit access to the information in the juvenile justice information system relating to the case of an individual only:

(1) by a criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose, as those terms are defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(2) for research purposes, by the Texas Juvenile Justice Department;

(3) with the written permission of the individual, by military personnel, including a recruiter, of this state or the United States if the individual is an applicant for enlistment in the armed forces[;]

(3) by the person who is the subject of the records on an order from the juvenile court granting the petition filed by or on behalf of the person who is the subject of the records;

(4) with the permission of the juvenile court at the request of the person who is the subject of the records; or

(5) with the permission of the juvenile court, by a party to a civil suit if the person who is the subject of the records has put facts relating to the person's records at issue in the suit.

Id. § 58.204(b) (The Eighty-third Legislature passed two different bills, House Bills 694 and 2862, adding subsection (b)(3)). Moreover, section 58.207 of the Family Code provides, in part:

(a) On certification of records in a case under Section 58.203, the juvenile court shall order:

(1) that the following records relating to the case may be accessed only as provided by Section 58.204(b):

...

(E) records maintained by a law enforcement agency[.]

(b) [O]n receipt of an order under Subsection (a)(1), the agency maintaining the records:

(1) may allow access only as provided by Section 58.204(b); and

(2) shall respond to a request for information about the records by stating that the records do not exist.

Id. § 58.207(a)(1)(E), (b). In this instance, the requestor is not one of the entities listed in section 58.204(b) to which access is allowed. Therefore, pursuant to the order of restricted access and section 58.207(b) of the Family Code, the city must respond to this request for information by stating a portion of the requested information does not exist.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k). Upon review, we find the information we have marked was used in investigations of alleged child abuse or neglect conducted by the city’s police department under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find the information we have marked is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. Although the requestor is a parent of the child victims listed in the information at issue, the child victims are now at least eighteen years old. Thus, the requestor no longer has a right of access to her adult children’s records under section 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.¹ Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under section 261.201(a)(2). Furthermore, you have not established the remaining information is a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under section 261.201(a)(1). *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4). Therefore, the city may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find none of the remaining reports identify a juvenile suspect or offender for the purposes of section 58.007. Accordingly, we find you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) to this information; thus, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683.

Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. In this instance, the requestor knows both the identity of the individual involved and the nature of the incident in one of the remaining reports. Therefore, withholding only the individual's identity or certain details of the incident from the requestor would not preserve the subject individual's common-law right to privacy. Accordingly, to protect the privacy of the individual to whom the information relates, the city must withhold the report we have marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.107(2) of the Government Code provides information is excepted from disclosure if "a court by order has prohibited disclosure of the information." Gov't Code § 552.107(2). Upon review, we find you have not established a court has prohibited disclosure of any of the remaining information. Accordingly, we find the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.107(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to the order of restricted access and section 58.207(b) of the Family Code, the city must respond to this request for information by stating a portion of the requested information does not exist. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code and common-law privacy. The city must also withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "N. A. Ybarra".

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/cbz

Ref: ID# 568729

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)