



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 8, 2015

Ms. Susan Fillion
Assistant County Attorney
Harris County Sheriff's Office
1200 Baker Street, 2nd Floor
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2015-13838

Dear Ms. Fillion:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 570811 (HSCO File Number #14SO400284).

The Harris County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for records related to the termination of a named officer, including a specified internal affairs investigation. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. We note section 552.108 is generally not

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

applicable to records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pel.); *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution).

You state the submitted information relates to a closed criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. However, the submitted information at issue reflects it was generated as part of an internal investigation conducted by the sheriff's office that was purely administrative in nature. Therefore, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(2) to the submitted information. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."² Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information were used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse; thus, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).*

of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As you do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we determine the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455(1987). This office has also found common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *Cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note criminal history information obtained by a law enforcement agency in the process of hiring a peace officer is a matter of legitimate public interest. We also note the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 542 (1990), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees), 432 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates.

Id. at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). We note CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI. This information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by DPS concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides in relevant part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual’s name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the open records law, Chapter 552.

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

Id. § 411.192(a)-(b). The information we have marked consists of concealed handgun license information obtained from DPS. In this instance, the requestor is neither the license holder nor a criminal justice agency. Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “Information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.)” *Id.* § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the dates of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code.³ *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117 also protects a peace officer's personal cellular telephone number if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. *See* Open Records Decision No. 670 at 6 (2001) (section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from disclosure peace officer's cellular telephone or pager number if officer pays for cellular telephone or pager service). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, the sheriff's office may not withhold the cellular telephone numbers at issue under section 552.117(a)(2) if a governmental body pays for the cellular telephone service.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, or social security number of an individual to whom this section applies, or information that reveals whether the individual has family members, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to employees of a district attorney or criminal district attorney. *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(5). Section 552.1175 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, provided a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. *See* ORD 506 at 5-6. Upon review, we find the information we have marked pertains to employees of the district attorney's office. Thus, if these individuals elect to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the sheriff's office must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. However, to the extent the telephone numbers we have marked consist of personal cellular telephone numbers, the sheriff's office may only withhold such telephone numbers under section 552.1175 if the cellular telephone service was not paid for by a governmental body. If no election is made, the sheriff's office may not withhold this information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code.⁴

We note the remaining information contains information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued

³Section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found in article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

⁴Regardless of section 552.1175, section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, section 411.083 of the Government Code, and 411.192 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must also withhold the information we have marked and indicated under sections 552.102 and 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, the sheriff's office may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. If the employees of the district attorney's office elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the sheriff's office must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. However, the sheriff's office may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers under section 552.1175 if the cellular telephone service was not paid for by a governmental body. Finally, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Katelyn Blackburn-Rader
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KB-R/akg

Ref: ID# 570811

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)