



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 28, 2015

Mr. Vance Hinds
Assistant Ellis County & District Attorney
Ellis County
109 South Jackson Street
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2015-15339

Dear Mr. Hinds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 573214.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received two requests from separate requestors for information, including video recordings, from a specified traffic stop. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by other statutes. You argue some of the submitted information is confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the federal Driver's Privacy Protection Act of 1994 (the "DPPA"), section 2721 of title 18 of the United States Code. Section 2721 provides, in part, the following:

- (a) In general.—A State department of motor vehicles, and any officer, employee, or contractor thereof, shall not knowingly disclose or otherwise make available to any person or entity:

(1) personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(3), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section; or

(2) highly restricted personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(4), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, without the express consent of the person to whom such information applies, except uses permitted in subsections (b)(1), (b)(4), (b)(6), and (b)(9)[.]

(b) Permissible uses.—Personal information referred to in subsection (a) . . . and, subject to subsection (a)(2), may be disclosed as follows:

(1) For use by any government agency . . . in carrying out its functions.

. . .

(c) Resale or redisclosure.—An authorized recipient of personal information (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11) or (12)) may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under subsection (b) (but not for uses under subsection (b)(11) or (12)). . . . Any authorized recipient (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11)) that resells or rediscloses personal information covered by this chapter must keep for a period of 5 years records identifying each person or entity that receives information and the permitted purpose for which the information will be used and must make such records available to the motor vehicle department upon request.

18 U.S.C. § 2721(a), (b)(1), (c). Section 2721(a) is applicable to state departments of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(a). Pursuant to section 2721(b), personal information may be disclosed to certain entities by a state department of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(b). However, we find the sheriff’s office is not a state department of motor vehicles nor does it assert it received the information at issue from a state department of motor vehicles. Therefore, the sheriff’s office has failed to demonstrate any of the submitted information is subject to section 2721(a) of the DPPA. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including [the Act], except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). The

sheriff's office has not established it compiles or maintains motor vehicle records; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the sheriff's office and it may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You argue a portion of the remaining information is excepted by section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the submitted information relates to a case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. You have marked the information you seek to withhold under this exception. However, upon review, we find some of the information you have marked does not consist of information that is subject to section 552.130. As such, this information, which we have marked for release, may not be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

marked, as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/dls

Ref: ID# 573214

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)