



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 31, 2015

Ms. Delietrice Henry
Open Records Assistant
City of Plano
Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2015-15653

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 576220 (OR# WILV051115).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for video and audio recordings pertaining to a specified arrest. The department claims the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.¹

¹You acknowledge, and we agree, the department did not comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nevertheless, sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302. The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987); *see, e.g.*, Open Records Decision No. 470 at 2 (1987) (because release of confidential information could impair rights of third parties and because improper release constitutes a misdemeanor, attorney general will raise predecessor statute of section 552.101 on behalf of governmental bodies). Thus, we will consider the applicability of sections 552.101 and 552.130 to the information at issue. We also note a governmental body may redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). However, we note the dates of birth of members of the public are generally not highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 at 7 (1987) (home addresses, telephone numbers, and dates of birth not protected under privacy). Upon review, we find the information you have labeled “medical” satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.² However, we conclude the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy,” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find none of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy and implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the remaining information is not confidential under constitutional privacy, and the department may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. The department must withhold

²As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the department’s other argument to withhold this information.

the audible license plate numbers in the submitted recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

To conclude, the department must withhold the information you have labeled "medical" under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the audible license plate numbers in the submitted recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/cbz

Ref: ID# 576220

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)