



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 3, 2015

Ms. Halfreda Anderson-Nelson
Public Information Officers
Senior Assistant General Counsel
Dallas Area Rapid Transit
P.O. Box 660163
Dallas, Texas 75266-0163

OR2015-15863

Dear Ms. Anderson-Nelson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 573886 (DART ORR #11566).

Dallas Area Rapid Transit ("DART") received a request for specified personnel files associated with a specified incident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information contains peace officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced,

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002. In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officers' TCOLE identification numbers in the submitted information do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information made confidential by section 40.321 of title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations. Section 40.321 relates to the confidentiality of workplace drug and alcohol testing and provides:

Except as otherwise provided in this subpart, as a service agent or employer participating in the [United States Department of Transportation] drug or alcohol testing process, you are prohibited from releasing individual test results or medical information about an employee to third parties without the employee's specific written consent.

(a) A “third party” is any person or organization to whom other subparts of this regulation do not explicitly authorize or require the transmission of information in the course of the drug or alcohol testing process.

(b) “Specific written consent” means a statement signed by the employee that he or she agrees to the release of a particular piece of information to a particular, explicitly identified, person or organization at a particular time. “Blanket releases,” in which an employee agrees to a release of a category of information (e.g., all test results) or to release information to a category of parties (e.g., other employers who are members of a C/TPA, companies to which the employee may apply for employment), are prohibited under this part.

49 C.F.R § 40.321. You state some of the submitted information constitutes drug and alcohol test results of a DART employee. You further state the information is maintained by DART pursuant to section 40.321 of title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations. You do not indicate that any written consent has been given with respect to disclosure of the information in question. *See id.* § 40.321(b). Based upon your representations and our review, we conclude DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 40.321 of title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses federal tax return information made confidential by section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term “return information” as a taxpayer’s “identity, the nature, source, or amount of . . . income.” *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term “return information” expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer’s liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff’d in part*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). Accordingly, DART must withhold the submitted W-4 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical

information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). This office has also determined a public employee's net pay is protected by common-law privacy even though it involves a financial transaction between the employee and the governmental body. See Attorney General Opinion GA-0572 at 3-5 (2007) (net salary necessarily involves disclosure of information about personal financial decisions and is background financial information about a given individual that is not of legitimate concern to public). However, there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. See ORDs 600 at 9 (information revealing employee participates in group insurance plan funded partly or wholly by governmental body is not excepted from disclosure), 545 (financial information pertaining to receipt of funds from governmental body or debts owed to governmental body not protected by common-law privacy). Furthermore, information pertaining to leave of public employees is generally a matter of legitimate public interest. See Open Records Decision No. 336 at 2 (1982) (names of employees taking sick leave and dates of sick leave taken not private). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, DART must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, DART may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]" Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, DART must withhold the dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). DART states some of the remaining information relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information we have indicated.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, DART may withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code.² Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117(a)(2) is applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). In this instance, we are unable to determine whether the individuals whose information is at issue are currently licensed peace officers as defined by article 2.12. Thus, we must rule conditionally. To the extent the individuals whose information is at issue are currently licensed peace officers as defined by article 2.12, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, DART may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. However, to the extent the individuals at issue are no longer licensed

²We note the Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987). We also note section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found in article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

peace officers as defined by article 2.12, DART may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

If the individuals at issue are no longer licensed peace officers, their personal information may be subject to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 552.024, .117(a)(1). We note section 552.117(a)(1) is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* ORD 506 at 5-6. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Therefore, to the extent the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, DART may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. However, to the extent the individuals at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, DART may not withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). DART must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Thus, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code provides, "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]," unless the owner of the

e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its release or the e-mail address is specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov't Code § 552.137(a)–(c). DART must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their release.

In summary, the TCOLE identification numbers in the submitted information are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 40.321 of title 49 of the Code of Federal Regulations. DART must withhold the submitted W-4 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. DART must withhold the dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. To the extent the individuals whose information is at issue are currently licensed peace officers as defined by article 2.12, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, DART may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. To the extent the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, DART must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, DART may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. DART must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code. DART must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their release. DART must release the remaining information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open_orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³We note the information being released includes an individual's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'JBH', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 573886

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)