



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 10, 2015

Mr. Caleb Thornton
Assistant County Attorney
County of Montgomery
501 North Thompson, Suite 300
Conroe, Texas 77301

OR2015-16469

Dear Mr. Thornton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 575071 (15PIA316).

The Montgomery County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for a specified investigation file. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers

used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You contend the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a). In this instance, however, the submitted information pertains to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect that occurred in a child care facility that is regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. Section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42. *Id.* § 261.201(h). Thus, section 261.201(a) of the Family Code is not applicable to the submitted information, and the sheriff's office may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Further, this office has also found that common-law privacy protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the types of information we marked in the submitted documents, as well as the corresponding information within the submitted audio and video recordings, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with

a governmental body,” unless the owner of the e-mail address consents to its release or the e-mail address falls within the scope of section 552.137(c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). We note the e-mail addresses at issue are not of types excluded by subsection (c). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold the types of information we marked in the submitted documents, as well as the corresponding information within the submitted audio and video recordings, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The remaining information must be released.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/som

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. However, the information contains the requestor’s clients’ social security number, which may not be withheld in this instance. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.023(a). We also note the information being released contains the requestor’s client’s e-mail address, and other personal information to which the requestor has a right of access under sections 552.023 and 552.137(b) of the Government Code. *See Id.* §§ 552.023, .137(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987).

Ref: ID# 575071

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)