



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 14, 2015

Ms. Josette Flores
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2015-16867

Dear Ms. Flores:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 575439 (El Paso Reference No. W036194-052015).

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident, including (1) the investigation and/or reprimand of officers of the city's fire department (the "department"), (2) the department's rescue efforts during the specified incident, and (3) the department's search efforts using divers following the specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy generally, you make no arguments regarding these doctrines. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy applies to the submitted information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

We note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information contains completed reports that are subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The city must release this information, which we have marked, pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App. –Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision No. 542 at 4 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 may be waived); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). Therefore, the city may not withhold the completed reports subject to section 552.022(a)(1) under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, we note section 552.117 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act.² Therefore, we will consider the applicability of section 552.117 for the information at issue. Additionally, we will consider your argument under section 552.103 for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). See ORD 551.

To demonstrate that litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must provide this office “concrete evidence showing that the claim that litigation may ensue is more than mere conjecture.” Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* We note that the fact that a potential opposing party has hired an attorney who makes a request for information does not establish that litigation is reasonably anticipated. See Open Records Decision No. 361 (1983). In Open Records Decision No. 638 (1996), this office stated that, when a governmental body receives a notice of claim letter, it can meet its burden of showing that litigation is reasonably anticipated by representing that the notice of claim letter is in compliance with the requirements of the Texas Tort Claims Act (the “TTCA”), Civil Practice and Remedies Code, chapter 101, or an applicable municipal ordinance. If that representation is not made, the receipt of the claim letter is a factor we will consider in determining, from the totality of the circumstances presented, whether the governmental body has established litigation is reasonably anticipated. See ORD 638 at 4.

You state the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code pertains to litigation reasonably anticipated by the city. To support this assertion you state, and provide documentation demonstrating, prior to the city's receipt of the instant request, the city received a notice of claim letter asserting the existence of claims against the city for personal injuries that arose from the specified incident. You do not affirmatively represent to this office the notice of claim complies with the TTCA or an applicable ordinance; therefore, we will only consider the notice of claim as a factor in determining whether the city reasonably anticipated litigation over the incident in question. Nevertheless, based on your representations, our review of the submitted information, and the totality of the circumstances, we determine the city has established it reasonably anticipated litigation prior to the date it received the request for information. We further find the information at issue

is related to the anticipated litigation for purposes of section 552.103. Accordingly, we conclude the city may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to all parties to the anticipated litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

We note some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a). Whether information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The city may only withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Therefore, if the individual whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Conversely, if the individual at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the city may not withhold the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code under section 552.103 of the Government Code. If the employee whose information is at issue timely elected confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kenny Moreland', written over a horizontal line.

Kenny Moreland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KJM/som

Ref: ID# 575439

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)