



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 18, 2015

Mr. Daniel Ortiz  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
Office of the City Attorney  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2015-17108

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 575996 (Reference Nos. 15-1026-6270, 15-1026-6299, 15-1026-6314, 15-1026-6333).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received four requests from different requestors for information regarding a specified accident. You state the department has released or will release some information to the requestors. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to any of the requests for information because it was created after the department received the requests for information. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department need not release non-responsive information to the requestors.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

- (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). The submitted information consists of information used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Accordingly, the submitted information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for the purposes of this section as a person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As we have no indication the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we conclude the submitted information is confidential

pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the department generally must withhold it from the third and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

However, the first and second requestors are the authorized representatives of parents of the child victims listed in the information, and these requestors' clients are not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the department may not withhold the submitted information from these requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states a governmental body must redact any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider whether the submitted information is otherwise excepted from release under the Act.

We note the submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report. Section 552.101 also encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2633, § 1 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1)). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. Transp. Code §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). Act of June 1, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2633, § 1 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065(c), (c-1)). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

Here, the first and second requestors are persons listed under section 550.065(c). Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the first and second requestors' statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the department must release the accident report to the first and second requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c).

Additionally, the third and fourth requestors have not demonstrated they are persons listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the third and fourth requestors do not have a right of access to the submitted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c). However,

section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, these requestors have a right of access to the redacted accident report. Although the department also asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, as noted above, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, ORDs. 613 at 4, 451. Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the third and fourth requestors' statutory access under section 550.065(c-1) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, although the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code requires the department to release the redacted accident report to the third and fourth requestors.

Therefore, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 261.201 of the Family Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W. 2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 261.201 generally pertains to all records of alleged child abuse or neglect, section 550.065(c-1) specifically pertains to accident reports. Therefore, we find section 550.065 is more specific than, and prevails over, section 261.201. Therefore, the department must release the redacted CR-3 accident report to the third and fourth requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the remaining submitted information from the third and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The department states the remaining information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the redacted accident report to the third and fourth requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) and must withhold the remaining information from the third and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must release the submitted accident report to the first and second requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which the department states it has released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Godden  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KLG/cz

Ref: ID# 575996

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 4 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)