



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 24, 2015

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2015-17553

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 577146.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You state you are releasing some information. You also state the department will redact certain information pursuant to Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-15075 (2011), 2011-15761 (2011), 2012-01375 (2012), and 2012-06459 (2012).¹ You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-15075 and 2011-15761 are previous determinations authorizing the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses, respectively, of 9-1-1 callers furnished to the department by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.118 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this office. Open Records Letter No. 2012-01375 is a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold motor vehicle lien information in a call sheet under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office. Open Records Letter No. 2012-06459 is a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold the price of a motor vehicle in a call sheet under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting a decision under section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history records information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28 of part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked in the remaining records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information you have marked in the remaining records satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked in the remaining records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the

department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code (1) in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law and (2) in conjunction with common-law privacy as well as the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/bhf

Ref: ID# 577146

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)