



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 3, 2015

Ms. Molly Shortall  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Arlington  
P.O. Box 90231  
Arlington, Texas 76004-3231

OR2015-18470

Dear Ms. Shortall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 578182 (Ref. No. WO22021).

The City of Arlington (the "city") received a request for all e-mail correspondence from a specified time period, containing specified terms.<sup>1</sup> You state the city is releasing some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.107 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the city sought and received clarification of the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purpose of clarifying or narrowing request for information). *See also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380 (Tex. 2010) (holding when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for public information, the ten-business-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

<sup>2</sup>Although you raise section 552.101 in conjunction with the attorney-client privilege under Texas Rule of Evidence 503 and with the attorney work product privilege under Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5, this office has concluded that section 552.101 does not encompass discovery privileges. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 1-2 (2002).

Initially, we note the submitted information includes information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code. § 552.022(a)(17). The city must release the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you seek to withhold the court-filed document under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 6 (Gov't Code § 552.107(1) is not other law for purposes of Gov't Code § 552.022), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally).* Therefore, the city may not withhold the court-filed document under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. The Texas Supreme Court has held, however, that the Texas Rules of Evidence are "other law" that make information expressly confidential for purposes of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). Therefore, we will address your claim under Texas Rule of Evidence 503 for the court-filed documents. We will also consider your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information not subject to section 552.022.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503 enacts the attorney-client privilege. Rule 503(b)(1) provides:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

(A) between the client or the client's representative and the client's lawyer or the lawyer's representative;

(B) between the client's lawyer and the lawyer's representative;

(C) by the client, the client's representative, the client's lawyer, or the lawyer's representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer's representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;

(D) between the client's representatives or between the client and the client's representative; or

(E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

Tex. R. Evid. 503(b)(1). A communication is "confidential" if not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client or reasonably necessary to transmit the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Accordingly, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must 1) show that the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; 2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and 3) show that the communication is confidential by explaining that it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and that it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. *See* ORD 676. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the entire communication is confidential under rule 503 provided the client has not waived the privilege or the communication does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in Rule 503(d). *Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein); *In re Valero Energy Corp.*, 973 S.W.2d 453, 457 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1998, orig. proceeding) (privilege attaches to complete communication, including factual information).

You indicate the submitted court-filed documents are included as attachments to a confidential communication among attorneys for the city, city employees, and elected officials of the city. You state the communications were made in confidence for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services and these communications have remained confidential. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the information at issue. Thus, the city may withhold the court-filed documents under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information that comes within the attorney-client privilege. The elements of the privilege under section 552.107(1) are the same as those discussed for rule 503. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. *See* ORD 676 at 6-7. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923.

You state the remaining information consists of communications among attorneys for the city, city employees, and elected officials of the city. You state the communications were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the city and these communications have remained confidential. Upon review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the remaining information. Therefore, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city may withhold the court-filed documents under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Keeney  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JDK/dls

Ref: ID# 578182

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)