



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 4, 2015

Ms. Elaina Polsen
Executive Director of Communications
Clear Creek Independent School District
2425 East Main Street
League City, Texas 77573

OR2015-18598

Dear Ms. Polsen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 578254 (CCISD ID Nos. 100740, 100747).

The Clear Creek Independent School District (the "district") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified request for proposals. You indicate the district has released some information to the requestors. Although the district takes no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state the release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Advantages School International; Apex Learning; Compass Learning, Inc. ("Compass"); Edgenuity, Inc. ("Edgenuity"); Edmentum; Fuel Education; and Odysseyware. Accordingly, the district states, and provides documentation showing, it notified these third parties of the request for information and of their rights to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from representatives of Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if

any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have received comments from only Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware explaining why their information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any of the remaining third parties has a protected proprietary interest in the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest the remaining third parties may have in the information.

Next, we note Compass and Edgenuity object to the disclosure of information the district has not submitted to this office for review. This ruling does not address information that was not submitted by the district and is limited to the information submitted as responsive by the district. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body requesting decision from Attorney General must submit copy of specific information requested).

Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware state some of their information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. Section 552.110 protects (1) trade secrets and (2) commercial or financial information the disclosure of which would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained. *See id.* § 552.110(a)-(b). Section 552.110(a) protects trade secrets obtained from a person and privileged or confidential by statute or judicial decision. *Id.* § 552.110(a). The Texas Supreme Court has adopted the definition of trade secret from section 757 of the Restatement of Torts, which holds a trade secret to be:

any formula, pattern, device or compilation of information which is used in one's business, and which gives him an opportunity to obtain an advantage over competitors who do not know or use it. It may be a formula for a chemical compound, a process of manufacturing, treating or preserving materials, a pattern for a machine or other device, or a list of customers. It differs from other secret information in a business . . . in that it is not simply information as to single or ephemeral events in the conduct of the business A trade secret is a process or device for continuous use in the operation of the business. . . . It may . . . relate to the sale of goods or to other operations in the business, such as a code for determining discounts, rebates or other concessions in a price list or catalogue, or a list of specialized customers, or a method of bookkeeping or other office management.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b (1939); *see also Hyde Corp. v. Huffines*, 314 S.W.2d 776 (Tex. 1958). In determining whether particular information constitutes a trade secret, this office considers the Restatement's definition of trade secret as well as the

Restatement's list of six trade secret factors.¹ RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b. This office must accept a claim information subject to the Act is excepted as a trade secret if a prima facie case for the exception is made and no argument is submitted that rebuts the claim as a matter of law. *See* ORD 552 at 5. However, we cannot conclude section 552.110(a) is applicable unless it has been shown the information meets the definition of a trade secret and the necessary factors have been demonstrated to establish a trade secret claim. Open Records Decision No. 402 (1983).

Section 552.110(b) protects “[c]ommercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.110(b). This exception to disclosure requires a specific factual or evidentiary showing, not conclusory or generalized allegations, substantial competitive injury would likely result from release of the information at issue. *Id.*; *see also* ORD 661 at 5.

Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware argue some of the information at issue constitutes commercial or financial information, the disclosure of which would cause the companies substantial competitive harm. We note the pricing information of a winning bidder, such as Compass, is generally not excepted under section 552.110(b). This office considers the prices charged in government contract awards to be a matter of strong public interest. *See* Open Records Decision No. 514 (1988) (public has interest in knowing prices charged by government contractors); *see generally* Dep’t of Justice Guide to the Freedom of information Act 344-345 (2009) (federal cases applying analogous Freedom of Information Act reasoning that disclosure of prices charged government is a cost of doing business with government). Further, the terms of a contract with a governmental body are generally not excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(3) (contract involving receipt or expenditure of public funds expressly made public); Open Records Decision No. 541 at 8 (1990) (public has interest in knowing terms of contract with state agency). Upon review, we find Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware have demonstrated portions of the information at issue, which we have marked, constitute commercial or financial information, the release of which would

¹The Restatement of Torts lists the following six factors as indicia of whether information constitutes a trade secret:

- (1) the extent to which the information is known outside of [the company];
- (2) the extent to which it is known by employees and other involved in [the company’s] business;
- (3) the extent of measures taken by [the company] to guard the secrecy of the information;
- (4) the value of the information to [the company] and [its] competitors;
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended by [the company] in developing the information;
- (6) the ease or difficulty with which the information could be properly acquired or duplicated by others.

RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b; *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 319 at 2 (1982), 306 at 2 (1982), 255 at 2 (1980).

cause the companies substantial competitive injury. Thus, the district must generally withhold the information we have marked under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code; however, to the extent Compass's customer information we have marked is publicly available on Compass's website, the district may not withhold any such information. Further, we find Compass, Edgenuity, and Odysseyware have not made the specific factual or evidentiary showing required by section 552.110(b) that release of any portion of the remaining information at issue would cause the companies substantial competitive harm. *See* ORD 661, 509 at 5 (1988) (because costs, bid specifications, and circumstances would change for future contracts, assertion that release of bid proposal might give competitor unfair advantage on future contracts is too speculative), 319 at 3 (information relating to organization and personnel, professional references, market studies, qualifications, and pricing are not ordinarily excepted from disclosure under statutory predecessor to section 552.110), 175 at 4 (1977) (résumés cannot be said to fall within any exception to the Act). Thus, the district may not withhold any portion of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code. We also find these third parties have failed to establish *prima facie* cases any of the remaining information at issue meets the definition of a trade secret, nor have these third parties demonstrated the necessary factors to establish a trade secret claim for the remaining information. *See* RESTATEMENT OF TORTS § 757 cmt. b; ORDs 402 (section 552.110(a) does not apply unless information meets definition of trade secret and necessary factors have been demonstrated to establish trade secret claim), 319 at 2. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”² Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Upon review, we find the district must withhold the insurance policy numbers contained in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the district must generally withhold the information we have marked under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code; however, to the extent Compass's customer information we have marked is publicly available on Compass's website, the district may not withhold any such information. The district must withhold the insurance policy numbers contained in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information; however, the district may only release information subject to copyright in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michael A. Pearle
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MAP/som

Ref: ID# 578254

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Dave Ratner
Counsel for Odysseyware
Creative Law Network, LLC
2036 East 17th Avenue
Denver, Colorado 80206
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joseph R. Knight
Counsel for Compass Learning, Inc.
Law Office of Joseph R. Knight
111 Congress Avenue, Suite 2800
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Linnea Grooms
Director of Legal Affairs
Edgenuity, Inc.
8860 East Chaparral, Suite 100
Scottsdale, Arizona 85250
(w/o enclosures)

Edmentum
c/o Elaina Polsen
Executive Director of
Communications
Clear Creek Independent School
District
2425 East Main Street
League City, Texas 77573
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Lars Gaade
Apex Learning
12515 Fourth Avenue, Suite 1500
Seattle, Washington 98161
(w/o enclosures)

Fuel Education
c/o Elaina Polsen
Executive Director of Communications
Clear Creek Independent School District
2425 East Main Street
League City, Texas 77573
(w/o enclosures)