



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 14, 2015

Ms. Molly Cost
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2015-19069

Dear Ms. Cost:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 577788 (DPS PIR#s 15-2779, 15-2917, 15-3351, 15-3394, & 15-3936).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received seven requests for information pertaining to a specified accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have only submitted photographs and video recordings. To the extent any other information responsive to the request exists and was maintained by the department on the date it received the request, we assume the department has released it to the requestors. If the department has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (noting that if a governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to the requested information, it must release information as soon as possible under circumstances).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The department contends the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201. However, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the submitted information involves a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect of a child made under chapter 261 or how the information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy, which protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S.589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the “zones of privacy,” pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. *See Fado v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir.1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. *See* ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

We note the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and therefore may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. See *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). However, the United States Supreme Court has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. See *Nat'l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 541 U.S. 157 (2004). The submitted information contains photographs of deceased individuals. You inform us you notified the deceased individuals' families of the request for information and of the families' right to assert a privacy interest in the submitted information. We note the representatives of the deceased individuals' families assert a privacy interest in the information at issue and object to its release. After reviewing the submitted comments and the information at issue, we find the families' privacy interest in some of the information at issue outweighs the public's interest in the disclosure of this information. Therefore, the photographs we have indicated are confidential pursuant to constitutional privacy and the holding in *Favish*.

However, we note the third and fifth requestors are representatives of family members of the deceased individuals. As such, these requestors have a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to any information relating to their clients' deceased family members that the department is required to withhold from the public on privacy grounds under *Favish*. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, with the exception of the information the department must release to the third and fifth requestors pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. However, we find none of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find none of the remaining information is highly

intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information the department must release to the third and fifth requestors pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Keeney
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDK/dls

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Ref: ID# 577788

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 7 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)

Sergeant Brad Merritt
Public Information Supervisor
Frisco Police Department
7200 Stonebrook Parkway
Frisco, Texas 75034
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. R. Wayne Gordon
Touchstone Bernays
4040 Renaissance Tower
1201 Elm Street
Dallas, Texas 75270-2196
(w/o enclosures)